



DFID CNTR: 00 0512A

SLGP Consultants' Report Number 205

(Original Number 251)

SEEDS Review – North East Zone

by

Chike Ogeah, Chris Umebese and Osita Nwafor

July 2000

Table of Contents

1.0	SUMMARY OF ALL ZONES.....	3
1.1	Similarities/Disparities in Zonal Bracket based on Review of States Report	3
1.2	State Outline.....	3
2.0	POLICY	4
2.1	Priority Linkages and Disparities between NEEDS and SEEDS.....	4
2.2	Situational Analysis, Policy Thrusts, Targets and Strategies	4
2.3	Whether Timelines for Targets are Realistic	4
2.4	Priority Areas that Address MDGs	5
2.5	Gender Mainstreaming.....	5
2.5.1	Budgets and Financing.....	5
2.5.2	Implementation, Monitoring and Evaluation and Pilot Projects	6

List of Tables

Table 1: State Outlines of States in the North East Zone	3
Table 2: Revenue Profile of North East Zone	5
Table 3: Recurrent Expenditure Profile of North East Zone.....	6
Table 4: Implementation and Monitoring and Evaluation Strategies of North East Zone	7

List of Annexes

Annex 1:	Adamawa State Seeds Review
Annex 2:	Bauchi State Seeds Review
Annex 3:	Borno State Seeds Review
Annex 4:	Gombe State Seeds Review
Annex 5:	Yobe State Seeds Review



Slgp

Acknowledgements

The consultants would like to thank the Economic Adviser, Chief Executive of National Planning Commission for providing the opportunity for these reviews and for providing staff support for the review exercise. Furthermore, their sincere appreciation goes to SLGP SEEDS Adviser, Mr. Obi Ugochukwu, for his time in providing guidance and prompt attention to issues as they arose in the course of the assignment.

Many thanks are also due to the Programme Manager and staff of the SLGP office in Abuja for their logistical support and cooperation throughout the period of this assignment.



1.0 SUMMARY OF ALL ZONES

1.1 Similarities/Disparities in Zonal Bracket based on Review of States Report

1.2 State Outline

Table 1 shows how the states in the Northeast zone of the federation compare around some specified key variables. The table shows that farming is a major economic activity in each of the five states of the zone. Information on this variable was not available for Borno state. Similar food and cash crops are also cultivated by each state. Barring the dearth of information for some of the states, no sharp disparities can be observed from the table. All the states revealed abundance of solid mineral deposits.

Table 1: State Outlines of States in the North East Zone

Key Variables	Adamawa	Bauchi	Borno	Gombe	Yobe
LGA	21	20	27	11	21
Land Area (sq.km)	42,158	49,259.01	69,436	20,265	N.A.
Population (million)	2.9	4.2	3.5	2.17	N.A.
Population Density (persons per sq. km)	68	N.A.	38	89.8	N.A.
Literacy rate (%)	44.6	N.A.	N.A.	N.A.	N.A.
Male	54.8				
Female	34.6				
Major Ethnic Groups	17	10	N.A.	16	N.A.
Major Languages (No.)	2	N.A.	3	N.A.	N.A.
Major Economic Activity	Farming	Farming	N.A.	Farming	Farming
Cash crops	Cotton, sugar, rice, groundnut	Cotton	N.A.	Cotton and groundnut	Cotton, groundnut, cowpea, benni seed, gum arabic and shea butter
Food crops	Maize, groundnut, millet, guinea corn, and Sorghum	Maize, groundnut, millet, guinea corn and rice	N.A.	Millet, sorghum, maize, vegetable	Maize, groundnut, millet, guinea corn, and Sorghum
SMEs Development	Active	N.A.	N.A.	N.A.	N.A.
Tourism Potentials	Exist	Rich	N.A.	N.A.	N.A.
Mineral Resources	Available	Available	N.A.	Rich	Rich



2.0 POLICY

2.1 Priority Linkages and Disparities between NEEDS and SEEDS

The five States of Adamawa, Bauchi, Borno, Gombe and Yobe covered all the priority areas of NEEDS in empowering people, promotion of private enterprises and changing the way government does its works. There are strong priority linkages between the State Policy Targets as contained in the SEEDS documents and NEEDS.

However, the five States need to review and streamline the targets to match resources and revenue base of the state under the Medium Term Expenditure framework.

2.2 Situational Analysis, Policy Thrusts, Targets and Strategies

- The arable land and peculiar terrain of the North East manifested in the states attempt to build their growth strategies around Agriculture. However, they fell short of clearly articulating strategies to drive the targets. This was obvious with Adamawa that duplicated targets as strategies. Furthermore, only Borno made effort to link program of converting farm produce and adding value for domestic market and export.
- The five States emphasized the need for private sector involvement in the growth of SMEs. However, States like Gombe, Adamawa and Bauchi had no coherent program on the growth of SMEs.
- Policy Thrust, Targets and Strategies on health across the five States focused on addressing issues of child and maternal mortality. They also dwelt extensively on health reforms with focus on training and recruiting additional personnel and refurbishing infrastructure.
- The program on Education across the five states addressed the issues of access to primary education. However, targets are not set based on concrete and reliable data.
- Water: Across the five States, there are problems of access to safe and clean water. States like Gombe has no targets and strategies to address the water problem in their State.
- Power: Erratic power and insufficient supply was obvious in the five States. Yobe has no clear targets on how to address them.
- Environment: Except for Adamawa and Bauchi, the other three States had no concrete program on the environment.
- Gender: While the States have programs on how to empower women and encourage gender equality, Adamawa seems to have the most aggressive Strategies to mainstream gender issues and achieve set targets.
- Tourism: The States are naturally endowed by nature and plan to develop the tourist sector. Yobe and Borno do not have a program.
- Public Sector Reforms: The five States have programs in place to reform the public sector.
- Youths: The five states have programs on Youth empowerment and poverty reduction.
- HIV/AIDS: The five States have aggressive program on how to address the prevalence of the HIV/AIDS crisis

2.3 Whether Timelines for Targets are Realistic

- There are no reliable baseline studies in the States to use as reference to draw comparisons
- The targets in most cases are too numerous and needs streamlining
- The absence of proper costing to match medium term targets are well pronounced in the documents
- Overall timelines for targets are not realistic.



2.4 Priority Areas that Address MDGs

- The 5 (Five) States programs addressed MDGs 1, 2, 4, 5, 6 and 8. However, there were no clear programs on how to tackle Malaria
- While there was mention of Gender issues in the document, Adamawa was very aggressive in highlighting how to empower women in the socio-economic sector
- Yobe does not have a program on the environment.
- The five States have relationships with development partners

2.5 Gender Mainstreaming

- The Adamawa State SEEDS program was detailed and comprehensive in mainstreaming gender issues in virtually all the socio-economic aspect of the State.
- Borno did well and needs to upgrade gender mainstreaming at the same level with Adamawa
- Bauchi, Gombe and Yobe mentioned gender issues but did not go far enough in mainstreaming them in the socio-economic life of the State.

2.5.1 Budgets and Financing

Tables 2 and 3 present state comparisons on revenue and expenditure around defined key variables in the zone. As shown in Table 2, a common feature of the revenue projections of the states is that there has been no basis for their projections hence they are all adjudged to be unrealistic.

On the expenditure side, all states had attempted to cost priority areas. In line with agriculture being the mainstay of the economies of states in the zone, only Yobe state has recognized this by making agriculture its top most priority in terms of fund allocation. While some states have proposed to finance their strategies within their resource envelopes, others have proposed to embark upon deficit financing. These disparities are reflected in Table 3 under funding gaps.

Table 2: Revenue Profile of North East Zone

Key Variables	Adamawa	Bauchi	Borno	Gombe	Yobe
Revenue sources identified	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
All revenues projected into 2007	Yes	Yes	Not available	No	No
Used conservative forecast for FAAC revenues projections.	No	Yes	Not available	Not available	Not available
Share of IGR to total revenue	3.9% (weak)	25%	Not available	Not available	Not available
Strategies to raise IGR level.	Proposed	Proposed	Not available	Not available	Not available
IGR subdivided into revenue sources	No	No	Not available	Not available	Not available
Basis for all revenue projections	Not available	Not available	Not available	Not available	Not available
Links between historical data and projections	Not established	Not established	Not available	Not available	Not available
Conclusion on revenue projections	Not realistic	Not realistic	Not realistic	Not possible	Not realistic

Table 3: Recurrent Expenditure Profile of North East Zone

Key Variables	Adamawa	Bauchi	Borno	Gombe	Yobe
Expenditure is projected into 2007	Yes	Yes	Yes	Expenditure Not Available	No (2005 Available)
Basis for expenditure projections	Not Available	Not Available	Not Applicable	Not Applicable	Not Available
Links between historical data and projections	None	None	Not Applicable	Not Applicable	Not Available
Financing gaps	Yes (N20.51bn)	Yes (N14.4bn)	Not Applicable	Not Applicable	No
Proposal to bridge this gap	Proposed	Proposed	Not Applicable	Not Applicable	Not Applicable
Costing of priority areas	Done	Done	Done	Not Applicable	Done
Costs assigned to policy targets	Not Available	Not Available	Not Available	Not Applicable	Not Available
Recurrent costs that are developmental in nature identified	No	No	No	Not Applicable	No
Spending distribution costed by capital and recurrent	Yes	Yes	No	Not Applicable	Yes
Priority areas identified	Economic Social Services Environment	Payment of entitlements. Access to towns and villages. Priority projects. Access to safe drinking water. Basic social services. Universal basic education.	Transport Health Education Agriculture and Rural Dev. Housing Youth Empowerment Water Supply.	Not Applicable	Economic sector (Agriculture) Social sector (Education) Regional Development (Water)
Plans for priority gains quantified in annual aggregates	Not Available	Not Available	Not Available	Not Applicable	Not Applicable
Cost sharing strategy	Not Available	Not Available	Not Available	Not Applicable	Not Applicable

2.5.2 Implementation, Monitoring and Evaluation and Pilot Projects

Although the bulk of the states (Borno, Gombe and Yobe) failed to propose a framework for implementation, monitoring and evaluation in their strategy documents, two states (Adamawa and Bauchi) had flaws in their proposals. There is enough reason to conclude that the zone has not excelled in proposing a sound implementation framework for their strategies as shown in Table 4. The pilots proposed defied the concepts of pilot projects.



Table 4: Implementation and Monitoring and Evaluation Strategies of North East Zone

Key Variables	Adamawa	Bauchi	Borno	Gombe	Yobe
Implementation					
Adequacy of Institutional arrangements for implementation identified	Adequate	Adequate	Not Adequate	Not Adequate	Not Available
Coordinating Agency identified.	Identified	Not Identified	Not Available	Not Available	Not Available
Independent Monitoring team proposed	Proposed	Proposed	Not Available	Not Available	Not Available
Roles of line ministries specified	Specified	Specified	Not Available	Not Available	Not Available
Roles of different stakeholders specified	Specified	Specified	Not Available	Not Available	Not Available
Adequacy of Action plan	Not Proposed	Not Proposed	Not Available	Not Available	Not Available
Risks assessed and mitigating factors proposed	Not Proposed	Not Proposed	Not Available	Not Available	Not Available
Monitoring and Evaluation					
Adequacy of Mechanism defined	Adequate	Fair	Not Available	Not Available	Not Available
Adequacy of Verifiable/measurable indicators defined	Not Proposed	Not Proposed	Not Available	Not Available	Not Available
Pilot Projects					
Adequacy of Pilot Projects identified	Not Adequate	Not Adequate	Not Available	Not Available	Not Adequate



ANNEX 1

ADAMAWA STATE SEEDS REVIEW



Table of Contents

1.0	INTRODUCTION.....	10
1.1	Background	10
1.2	Objective of the Review.....	11
1.3	Approach	11
1.4	Limitations	11
2.0	REVIEW OF ADAMAWA STATES SEEDS.....	11
2.1	Profile of Adamawa State.....	11
2.2	Policy.....	12
2.2.1	Priority Linkages and Disparities between NEEDS and SEEDS	12
2.2.2	Situational Analysis, Policy Thrusts, Targets and Strategies	12
2.2.3	Whether Timelines for Targets are Realistic	16
2.2.4	Priority Areas that Address MDGs.....	19
2.2.5	Gender Mainstreaming.....	19
2.3	Budget and Financing	20
2.3.1	Revenue and Revenue Sources.....	20
2.3.2	Emerging Queries and Issues on Revenue Assumptions	21
2.3.3	Costing and Projection of Priority Areas.....	22
2.3.4	Spending Distribution Costed by Capital and Recurrent Expenditure	22
2.3.5	Spending Priorities and Gain.....	22
2.3.6	Funding Plan among Stakeholders	22
2.3.7	Funding Gaps and Solutions	23
2.4	Implementation.....	23
2.4.1	Institutional Arrangements for Implementation.....	23
2.4.2	Roles of Stakeholders	23
2.4.3	Specific Risks and Mitigation.....	23
2.4.4	Action Plan	23
2.5	Monitoring and Evaluation.....	24
2.5.1	Mechanisms for Monitoring and Evaluation.....	24
2.5.2	Verifiable and Measurable Indicators	24
2.6	Pilot Projects	24
3.0	RECOMMENDATIONS AND NEXT STEPS.....	25
3.1	Recommendations	25
3.2	Next Steps.....	25



1.0 Introduction

1.1 Background

The National Planning Commission (NPC) has taken responsibility for developing a State Economic Empowerment and Development Strategy (SEEDS) programme. In the context of NEEDS, and the fact that over fifty-two percent of the federal allocation is distributed to States and Local Governments, it was felt important that there should not just be strategies developed for federal governance improvement, but also for states.

The role of the NPC in developing SEEDS is clearly different from the role of federal ministries in the development of NEEDS. NEEDS is a strategy developed by the Federal Government with a measure of popular involvement. Likewise, SEEDS must be developed by State Governments. It is not for NPC to develop it for them. NPC's role is as a facilitator in this process.

In the last one and a half years since the development of SEEDS, all 36 states and the Federal Capital Territory (FCT) have developed their SEEDS document, which are at various stages of preparation. The FCT version of SEEDS is called FEEDS. Despite this, there is very little knowledge of what the SEEDS documents are proposing, whether they are achievable and what they mean for Federal Government's ability to develop a coordinated development agenda through the NEEDS/SEEDS program.

The NPC has also embarked on a benchmarking exercise from 6th June. Twenty-nine of the 36 states volunteered themselves to be part of this exercise. The process was organized around four benchmarks, which are meant to test the quality of each state's SEEDS. It is anticipated that the exercise will result in a scoring and ranking of the states. FG and donors plan to use the results of this exercise to identify states that can receive additional project support as best performers and states that will receive technical support to advance to a level where they can qualify for project support.

It is also expected that this exercise will also put the states in a position to focus on areas of improvement, which may mean further revision of their SEEDS. In anticipation of this the NPC has drafted a revised version of the SEEDS manual to provide more detailed guidance on how to make each state's SEEDS more effective. Also, NPC thinks it is important to begin to review all the state SEEDS so as to develop a knowledge base that can help in their dialogue with the states and national development objectives. This will also help NPC in any plans to revise NEEDS, which it hopes can leverage off state SEEDS and provide a more uniform and efficient national development agenda.

It is against this background that the Economic Adviser and Chief Executive of the NPC has approved for a team of NPC staff, supported by national consultants, to review all the SEEDS documents and build a knowledge base of what the SEEDS documents are proposing and how they affect the country's development objectives.



1.2 Objective of the Review

The objective of the review is to build a knowledge base of what Adamawa State SEEDS (ADSEEDS) documents is proposing and how it affects the country's development objectives.

1.3 Approach

The approach employed was a desk review of ADSEEDS and building a knowledge base on its proposals using some specified key variables. These variables ultimately formed the basis of comparing all the states in the Northeast zone.

1.4 Limitations

Some of the prints were blurred constituting visual impediment. There is reason to believe that a second volume of the document existed elsewhere, which was not available at the time of review. Time for the review of the five documents was considered too short.

2.0 Review Of Adamawa States SEEDS

2.1 Profile of Adamawa State

Adamawa state is one of the states in the North East geopolitical zone. Created 1991, it currently has 21 Local Government Areas. Its population is estimated to be 2.9million. With a landmass of 42,158sq.km the state has a population density of 68 persons per sq.km (2000 figure). Population distribution by gender (1991) stood at 1.1million males and 1.1million females. There are, however, more males than females in LGAs of Yola, Mubi South and North and Fufore. Age distribution reveals that 10 years and below is 33.3% while 44.8% (more males are in this bracket) are below 15 years.

The literacy level is 44.6% (1991), of which 34.6% are female and 54.8% males. There are 17 major ethnic groups. Widely spoken native languages are Hausa and Fulfulde.

Agriculture is the major occupation of the people. Major staple food crops produced include maize, yam, guinea corn, rice, millet, cassava and sorghum while cash crops include cotton, sugar, rice and groundnut. However while the Fulanis in the state rear cattle communities on the banks of rivers Benue and Gongola engage in fishing. The major economic activity of the state is farming which provides employment to about 80% of the population. Small and medium enterprises (SMEs) are very active in the state. Tourist attractions include Sukur hills, Gashaka/Gumti National Park and Koma hills.

There is a need to update some of the statistics used to 2004 to make them valid for use in preparing ADSEEDS. Such statistics will include those for population distribution, population density, literacy rate etc.



2.2 Policy

2.2.1 Priority Linkages and Disparities between NEEDS and SEEDS

NEEDS	Adamawa SEEDS
<u>Empowering People:</u> Health, education, environment, integrated rural development, housing development, employment and youth development, safety nets, gender and geopolitical balance, and pension reforms	Agriculture, Health, Education, Housing, environment, Safety Nets, Gender issues, and natural resource
<u>Promoting private enterprise:</u> Security and rule of law, infrastructure, finance, sectoral strategies, privatization and liberalization, trade, regional integration, and globalization	SME, Privatization of State Owned Enterprises, security, investment friendly climate
<u>Changing the way the government does its work:</u> Public sector reforms, privatization and liberalization, governance, transparency and anticorruption, service delivery, budget, and expenditure reforms	Public Sector Reforms, Service Delivery, Governance, Transparency and Anti- Corruption, Budget and Expenditure Reforms

Adamawa State SEEDS comprehensively covered all the priority areas of NEEDS in empowering people; promotion of private enterprises and changing the way government does its works. There are strong priority linkages between the State Policy Targets as contained in the SEEDS document and NEEDS.

A critical review of the policy thrusts reveal the need to streamline policy targets to match resources and revenue base of the state under the Medium Term Expenditure framework.

2.2.2 Situational Analysis, Policy Thrusts, Targets and Strategies

Agriculture

- Land mass of 42, 159 sq km and population of 2.7 Million people out of which 344,166 families are engaged in agriculture
- Arable land, Agricultural products (Maize, Millet, Rice, Groundnuts, Cotton, Sugar, Cassava, Yams), Large Livestock
- Income is low and infrastructures and technological base are relatively weak
- Poor linkage between Agriculture and small and medium scale enterprises (SMEs)

SMEs

- Poor Industry profile with 80% of industries operate with low capacity
- Industry layout in Mubi and Yola

Education

- 164 Early Child Care and Nursery
- 1553 Primary Schools with an enrollment of 641,883, Teachers 19,487



Slgp

- Post Primary Schools 2150 streams, 98,150 students, Teacher Pupil ratio 1: 72.

Health

- Trained personnel, Government commitment to rehabilitate facility, low level of stigma for those living with HIV, Poor Infrastructure, High overhead charge rate of 79%, Poor administration in retirement

Water

- Surface water potentials from various rivers in the state
- Trained work force to manage water supply, obsolete machinery, poor data recordings, poor attitude of consumers, Low technical skill of work force

Power

- Evenly distributed in the LGAs, hooked to the national grid, Supply is with a capacity of 132KV line from Gombe, overloaded conductors, 330 KV line to resolve problem

Security

- Poor security, Disaster prone areas: Flooding, rainstorms, poor judicial system, vigilante groups, community policing, independent legislature, and ethno religious crisis

HIV/AIDS

- Prevalence rate is 7.6%(versus 4.8% national average), 57,149 infected in the 15-49 age bracket, 268,990 people infected

Environment

- 50% trained, experienced and committed manpower in the Ministry of Environment
- Organized Private sector are not involved the environment, Poor waste disposal machinery, Inadequate funding and lack of available data on the environment

Transport and Housing

- Poor funding, Railway and water transportation are not available, Bureaucratic bottlenecks in acquiring plots of land by private estate developers

Pension and Gratuity Reforms

- Inability to meet gratuity obligations as at when due usually 6-12 months from date of retirement
- Inadequate information about pensioners, outstanding gratuity of N365 Million, current population of pensioners, Retirement age of 60 or 35 years of service

Women, Youth and Child Development

- Committed and empowered female personnel, support from the executive and the legislature especially house committee on women affair, Strong linkage by CBOs, NGOs in women and children related programme.

Safety Nets for Vulnerable Groups

- Majority of the poor live in rural area and Self help poverty reduction programs,
- Well-coordinated programs between government and the donor agencies. Limited access to farmland for women. High cost of farm inputs.

Solid Minerals

- Four mineral deposits, 50 different varieties of minerals,



Culture and Tourism

- 42 Hotels out of which three belongs to the Organized Private Sector and nine owned by government.

Information and Communication Technology

- Obsolete equipment, existence of government owned media houses

Good Governance and Public Sector Reform

- Anti corruption policies in place, rightsizing and due process mechanism
- Due Process and Procurement structures in place

Privatization

- 10 functional industries mostly SMEs, SOEs in deteriorating condition with equipment lying redundant

Agriculture: The Agriculture Policy thrust of the state is designed to take advantage of the vast opportunities existing in the Agricultural sector with a large landmass to jump-start the economy of the state. There is a disconnect between the targets and the strategies. The strategies should have focused on how to realize the targets. The observation is that the strategies are a duplication of the targets and needs to be properly articulate to synchronize with the situational analysis, policy thrust and targets.

SME: The policy target that focuses on privatisation of SOEs and establishment of the new industries will address the poor industry profile of the state where 80% of the industry operates with low capacity. The strategies to increase the capacity of the electricity in the grid from Gombe are adequate. Overall, a policy thrust that encourages private sector driven industrialization program will reverse the existing negative trend in the state.

Education: The focus on access to universal basic education and improving standards connotes strong relationship between policy trusts, targets and strategies. This is adequate and can be implemented if the targets are well costed. The training of more teachers will address the teacher pupil ratio positively.

Health: The health policy thrust is geared towards ensuring a well-managed health system with enduring policy framework and structures that will meet the health needs of the state. The targets are quite adequate if they are properly costed. There may be need to streamline the number of targets within a manageable level bearing in mind budgetary allocation to the health sector.

Water: The policy targets to increase access to clean water by 20% are in line with the strategies to take advantage of availability of surface water abound in the state.

Power: The policy thrust to increase the level of power supply from 132 KVA to 330 KVA will address the problem of epileptic power supply in the State. This is adequate.

Security: The strategies to strengthen the security apparatus of the state by formation of vigilante groups, community policing and strengthening of the criminal justice system synchronizes with the policy thrust. This is adequate.



HIV/AIDS: The Policy thrust to streamline HIV/AIDS into the critical sectors of the economy has strong correlation in reducing the Prevalence rate of 7.6% (versus 4.8% national average), and control the spread of the disease. Funding will be critical in this area but state can attract donor support if there are clear statements and political will to implement strategies and meet targets.

Environment: The Policy thrust was designed to manage the chaotic environmental situation marked by poor waste disposal. The strategies if well implemented and adequately funded can ensure a clean and fresh environment.

Transport and Housing: The policy targets and thrust when synchronize with the strategies will address the transport and housing issues in the SEEDS document.

Pension and Gratuity Reforms: The policy thrust and strategies was designed to clear the backlog of pension arrears in the state. The strategies to checkmate falsification of age in the state civil service were meant to reduce complications in pension management.

Women, Youth and Child Development: Mainstreaming of gender issues in critical priority sector will empower women to compete in the state. The various youth programs will encourage acquisition of skills for job placement in the market place.

Safety Nets for Vulnerable Groups: The policy thrust of inclusiveness in a well-articulated program between the government and the donor agencies will empower the vulnerable groups.

Solid Minerals: The strategies of geological mapping, mineral resource survey will be critical in exploring the mineral potentials of the state. This is adequate.

Culture and Tourism: The inflow of tourist realigns with the strategies of grading the hotels in the state and development of tourist sites. This is adequate. The privatisation program will take care of the hotels owned by the government to encourage private sector participation in the tourist sector.

Communication Technology: ICT Policy thrust and Strategies is meant to update the state of communication infrastructure in the state broadcasting services. This is adequate.

Public Sector Reform and Good Governance: There is a link between the policy thrust to right size the civil service, fight corruption and ensure due process in procurement. This is adequate.

Privatization: The policy thrust that will ensure privatisation of SOEs is in line with government plan to operate a private sector growth driven strategy.



2.2.3 Whether Timelines for Targets are Realistic

SME

- Dialogue with 50% of private sector organizations by 2007
- Promulgate four enabling legislative laws and friendly policies to facilitate economic development by 2007
- Develop Industrial layouts by 2007
- Assist private sector to promote at least five industries in the state by 2007
- Assist private sector to develop mineral sector and provide access roads to deposit sites by 2008
- Develop at least 20 SMEs per local government by 2007

Comment: Private sector involvement in the industrial program of the state as enunciated in the SEEDS document is not aggressive. Targets should focus on the medium term and not go beyond 2007. The framework for developing 20 SMEs per local government is not realistic.

Education

- Increase enrolment by 10% in 2007
- Increase parental awareness in nursery education
- Train 50 Nursery education personnel
- Provision of instructional materials for nursery education
- Increase enrolment in Primary Schools by 10% in 2007
- Provide instructional materials to Primary Schools
- Introduce Computer literacy in 181 Secondary School
- Renovation of 39 Hostels and 39 Classrooms

Comment: Targets are measurable and realistic. Costing will be crucial in realising the targets.

Health

- At the end of 2005 all the stakeholders are enlightened on the reform process
- By mid 2005 all hospitals (secondary and Tertiary) will have governing Boards
- By first quarter of 2005 a health services commission is inaugurated
- By 2nd quarter of 2005 all hospitals will have management committees
- By first quarter of 2005 law establishing the reform system has been passed
- By first quarter of 2005 financial and human resources management will be in place
- By end of 2006 a state Health Insurance Scheme will be established

Comments: Targets are realistic. However, targets for the various sub sectors in the SEEDS document needs to be streamlined.

Water

- The initial target is for the State Government to meet economic target of improving service coverage from 50% to 70% in urban and semi-urban areas by the 2007.
- To increase access of urban populace to clean water from 30% to 50% by 2007.
- To increase provision of potable water is a priority by 2007.

Comments: Targets are well streamlined, specific, measurable and achievable.



Power

- Electrification of 150 communities by 2007
- Survey of 150 communities for the project
- sensitization of communities to protect electrical installation

Comments: Targets are realistic and measurable.

Agriculture

- Increase food and cash crop production by 20%
- 1000 pairs of work bulls and ploughs procured annually for sale at 50% subsidy to farmers
- Reduce animal disease by 50% in the next three years
- Maintain 1000 MT buffer stock of agricultural commodities
- Increase farmers access to agric technologies by 20%
- To increase quantity wholesome meat from zoonotic diseases to be guaranteed for public consumption

Comments: Targets are measurable and time bound. The only shortcoming is lack of clear-cut strategies to meet the targets. The targets are duplicated as strategies.

Environment

- Waste reduction and recycling to be realized by 30% by 2007
- Employment are increased by 2007
- Biodegradable waste are turned to manure realizable by 20% by 2007
- Menace of flooding to reduce by 30% by 2007
- Waste elimination in Michika, Yola, Mubi and Ganye
- Manpower development to tackle environmental health problems

Comment: Target 1, 3 and 4 are specific, measurable and time bound. It is difficult to measure how realistic they are since they are no reference to draw your comparison.

Solid Minerals

- State wide survey of mineral resources carried out in 2004
- Commercial exploitation of 10 different solid minerals in 2005

Comment: Targets are realistic, measurable and time bound.

Safety Nets for Vulnerable Group

- Reduce the number of people living below poverty line by 10% in 2007

Comment: Target is realistic and measurable.

Gender

- To reduce the incidence of child abuse by 30% by 2007
- To increase participation of children in decision making
- To reduce children involved in street begging by 20% by year 2007
- To reduce HIV/AIDS infection by 50% of 7.6% by 2007
- To increase treatment centres to at least three in each senatorial district by 2007
- To reduce poverty level by 15% by 2007 among orphans and widows

Comment: Target 2 is not specific. Target 1, 3, 4, 5 and 6 are timebound.



Public Sector Reform

Using due process to ward off unethical practices in the public service

- Elimination of redundancy, waste, ghost workers and promotion of efficiency and growth
- Encourage equality before the law and supremacy of the law
- Independence of the judiciary
- Effect change in the Chiefs Judge's Chambers
- Procurement of goods and services
- Institutional reforms: Civil Servants and Public Office Holders should be right sized

Comments: Targets should be time bound.

Housing

- Housing for the populace and basic infrastructure
- Use of locally sourced raw materials in construction
- Empowerment and skills in construction

Comments: These targets are not measurable and time bound.

HIV/AIDS

- Reduce HIV/AIDS infection by 50%
- Increase treatment centre to at least 3 by 2007
- Reduce poverty among orphans and widows by 2007
- Legislation in place to protect the right of PLWHA to free treatment
- Establishment of a body of advocate on behalf of orphans and widows by December 2007
- Equip diagnostic centres with VCT facilities in the state hospitals by 2006
- 30% of state HIV orphans and widows to be rehabilitated
- Community advocacy in all the senatorial zones
- Awareness of people towards HIV prevention, care and support

Comment Target 1 is measurable but not time bound. Target 3, 4, 5 and 8 are not timebound. Targets 1, 2 and 6 are specific, time bound and realistic.

Tourism

- Increase inflow of tourist by 2% annually from 2005-2007

Comment: Target is realistic but not aggressive. They are measurable and time bound.

Overall Comments:

SEEDS document does not give current indices, thus making it difficult to determine whether stated targets are realistic.



2.2.4 Priority Areas that Address MDGs

MDGs	Adamawa State
1. Eradicate extreme poverty and hunger	The program to encourage acquisition of skills by youths and access to farmland by women clearly focuses on eradicating extreme poverty and hunger.
2. Achieve Universal Primary Education	Priority areas of developing early childhood and primary education meets MDG goal 2 of achieving universal primary education
3. Promote Gender Equality and Empower Women	While there are programs of gender mainstreaming in the areas of economic empowerment, however, the strategies fall short of specifying how to address the discrimination against property ownership by women. Programs that will enable women have access to farmland promotes gender equality and empowerment.
4. Reduce Child Mortality	The health priority focuses on reducing child mortality rate
5. Improve Maternal Health	The health priorities addresses improvement in maternal health
6. Combat HIV/AIDS, Malaria and Other Diseases	The policy trust and targets to reduce HIV prevalence rate by halve and provide succour to PLWHA partly meets MDG goals. There was no clear mention of how to combat malaria.
7. Ensure environmental Sustainability	The States program on environment meets MDG goals
8. Develop a global partnership for development	The States collaboration with Donor Agencies like UNDP and the World Bank qualifies them for meeting this MDG goal

2.2.5 Gender Mainstreaming

The Adamawa State SEEDS identified the problem of women in having access to quality education

- Poor HIV education
- Low girl child enrolment and attendance ratio in schools
- The root causes were identified in the SEEDS document. To address the problem, targets to increase girl child enrollment by 2007 to 30% and reduction in child labour practice were outlined.

The State SEEDS further identified the problem of:

- reproductive health,
- high level of maternal morbidity and mortality,
- High proportion of HIV/AIDS among women.
- Measurable targets were designed to increase maternal rate to 500 per 100,000, reduce morbidity rate by 30% and level of education by 40% by 2007.

The State SEEDS identified

- Poor sanitation
- Unclean water intake that promotes opportunistic infection among fisher folks



- Measurable targets to improve sanitation, safe water consumption of fisher folks by 30% in 2007, reduce susceptibility to infectious diseases by 10% and create awareness on HIV/AIDS by 50% by 2007.

The SEEDS document recognized the need to include women in core development program by providing micro credit program, training of 500 women and 5000 women in bee keeping.

- The SEEDS document identified over reliance of women in firewood due to lack of alternative source of energy. This is caused low literacy level and could be sourced by increased alternative source of domestic energy by 2007.
- The SEEDS document recognized the low participation of women in industry especially in employment in manufacturing and service companies. This could be addressed by increased employment of women by 10-30%
- The SEEDS document recognized low level of ownership of hotels and limited participation by women in tourism activities in Adamawa State.
- The SEEDS document identified the low level of women in politics and military and Para-military institutions. To redress the situation, participation by 10% by 2007 of the number of women in judiciary, House of representative and security sector by 8% by 2007 and number of female school age children by 10% by 2007.

2.3 Budget and Financing

2.3.1 Revenue and Revenue Sources

Table 1 shows approved 2005 recurrent revenue summary and their sources in the state.

As shown in the table, a subdivision of IGR into revenue sources has not been made. The share of IGR to total revenue is a meager 3.9% making the state financially unstable.

Table 1: APPROVED 2005 REVENUE SUMMARY IN N billions						
S/n	Details of Revenue	Actual Collections 2004	Estimates 2005	Total Surplus	% of Total Surplus Revenue	% Share of Total Revenue
1	IGR	0.25	0.76	0.51	4.2	3.9
2	VAT	0.83	1.89	1.06	8.9	9.8
3	Statutory Allocation	6.20	16.11	9.91	82.7	83.7
4	Stabilization Fund	0.00	0.08	0.08	0.0	0.0
5	Ecological Fund	0.00	0.03	0.03	0.0	0.0
6	Internal Loans	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.0	0.0
7	External Loans	0.00	0.50	0.50	4.2	2.6
8	Grants	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.0	0.0
9	Excess Crude	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.0	0.0
10	Miscellaneous	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.0	0.0
	TOTAL	7.28	19.26	11.98	100.0	100.0



Revenue projections were made from 2005-2007 forming the basis for expenditure projections to finance the strategies. Revenue projections for 2005-2007 are N19.3bn, N22.7bn and N23.9bn

Internally Generated Revenue (IGR) is assumed to increase due to the recent review of tax rates in the State, which is acceptable but the rate has not been given.

2.3.2 Emerging Queries and Issues on Revenue Assumptions

- Stabilization fund was not received in 2003 and 2004 and nothing points to the fact that it will be available for 2005-2007 plan period. Although not discussed in the document, it is hoped that the state actually maintains an account for this fund given its numerous advantages.
- Ecological fund has only been received once (i.e. in 2002 (N3.6bn)) since 1999. There is no reason to justify the provision of N250, 000 for it in 2005.
- The source of N500m external loan to be obtained in 2005 was not specified to ensure contracts and/or loan agreements evidencing disbursements have been secured.
- Conservative forecasts for Federal Allocation revenues have not been used. A revenue surplus of 82.7 percent for statutory allocation appears very ambitious and unattainable given that this source of revenue is beyond the state' control. Even if there is an indication of the sharing of excess crude (though not likely now following the turn of national events – debt forgiveness and the need for debt servicing, etc.) from FAAC the percentage surplus appears too high.
- Basis for revenue projections (i.e. growth rates for each source of revenue curled from past performances) were however not available. Hence, it becomes difficult to say whether the revenue projections are realistic or not.
- The link between historical data and the projections cannot be established.

Overall, the state recognizes that its weak IGR status is a mark of financial instability on its part and had proposed some drastic measures it intends to implement in the next three years to raise its level of internal revenues. Some of the strategies that have been recommended to deal with include the following:

- Revamping and reorganizing the State Board of Internal Revenue for greater effectiveness.
- Eliminate waste through 'Due Process' in procurement and reintroduce Tenders Board system.
- Instill budget discipline on budget officers to comply with budget ceilings.
- Establish debt management office.
- Build staff capacity
- Privatize all public sector enterprises.
- Implement fully the monetisation programme policy

In conclusion, the revenue projections are not likely to be realistic.



2.3.3 Costing and Projection of Priority Areas

Costing and projection of priority areas was done but the costing structure was however not budgeting compliant. A balance budget has not been achieved as State expenditure was observed to be outside the confines of the resource envelope. State resources cannot adequately finance the development strategies.

Table 2 summarizes the revenue projections against sectoral investment costs from 2005-2007.

Revenue projections for 2005-2007 are N19.3bn, N22.7bn and N23.9bn while expenditure for the period amounted to N27.4bn, N30.97bn and N28.04bn, respectively. Extrapolations reveal existence of huge financing gaps of N8.2bn, N8.2bn and N4.1bn for 2005, 2006 and 2007, respectively.

Year	Total Revenue	Expenditure			Funding Gap
		Capital	Recurrent	Total	
2005	19.26	6.88	20.56	27.44	8.18
2006	22.74	7.69	23.28	30.97	8.23
2007	23.94	5.00	23.04	28.04	4.10
Total	65.94	19.58	66.87	86.45	20.51

2.3.4 Spending Distribution Costed by Capital and Recurrent Expenditure

Spending distribution for the period was costed by capital and recurrent (Table 2). However the document has not revealed that costs were assigned to policy targets and also no conscious efforts have been made to identify those recurrent costs that are developmental in nature.

2.3.5 Spending Priorities and Gain

Sectoral spending priorities were identified. Foremost priorities in descending order of spending for the period (2005-2007) include:

- Economic - 27.06%
- Social Services - 24.23%
- Environment - 16.07%

Administration is 32.65 % of total capital allocation.

2.3.6 Funding Plan among Stakeholders

A cost sharing strategy (e.g. LGAs, PPP, NGOs, Donors) has not been distinctly articulated in the State strategy document.



2.3.7 Funding Gaps and Solutions

The total funding gap for the period (2005-2007) amounted to N20.51bn. The state expects to bridge this gap through the gains from its various reforms especially those dealing with repositioning of its internal revenue board, curbing wastes etc. Short-term borrowing is another option the state considers. In all, priority gains have not been quantified in annual aggregates and therefore state plans for such gains have not been articulated.

2.4 Implementation

2.4.1 Institutional Arrangements for Implementation

Identified institutional framework for implementation proposed is as follows:

- Set up an Independent Monitoring Committee (IMC) with membership from public and private sector, traditional institutions and civil society.
- Chairman, State Planning Commission (SPC) heads the IMC.
- IMC reports to Executive Council (ExCo), State House of Assembly (SHA), Traditional Institutions and the Council of Chiefs.
- IMC submits quarterly reports, which is ultimately posted on State web site.

The framework for implementation is adequate. However a graphical illustration will clearly demonstrate the linkages and reporting lines.

2.4.2 Roles of Stakeholders

Line ministries shall implement the strategies and report directly to Ministry of Finance and Budget (MoFB), SPC and IMC.

SPC and MoFB will report directly to IMC.

SPC coordinates roles of MoFB, Service Delivery Unit and Control, State NEPAD, UN and Development Partners and State Council of Civil Society.

The Private Sector, Donor Agencies and civil society groups will interrelate with SPC, Service Delivery Unit and Control, State NEPAD, UN and Development Partners and State Council of Civil Society.

The State Planning Commission (SPC) will coordinate and provide the focal point for the monitoring effort.

To further strengthen the implementation of ADSEEDS, there would have to be legislative interventions where required. Some of the new legislations needed to implement ADSEEDS include Pension reform, monetization of fringe benefits, establishment of stabilization fund, revision of tax laws, revision of certificate of occupancy, edict of property rights and incentives for private sector investment.

2.4.3 Specific Risks and Mitigation

Specific risks and mitigating factors have not been identified

2.4.4 Action Plan

Defined action plan has not been supplied.



2.5 Monitoring and Evaluation

2.5.1 Mechanisms for Monitoring and Evaluation

Institutional Framework for Monitoring the Implementation of the ADSEEDS was proposed which includes:

- Independent Monitoring Committee
- Line Ministries
- NGOs and Civil Society

The chief executive and accounting officers of ministries, extra ministerial departments and parastatals will monitor the service deliveries of various agencies. Beneficiaries and the association of civil society group will also be involved in the monitoring of policies and programmes.

The State Planning Commission (SPC) will coordinate and provide the focal point for the monitoring effort.

The Independent Monitoring Committee (IMC), SPC, traditional institutions and the press shall undertake an annual joint monitoring tour of projects (JMTP).

The M&E framework is considered adequate.

2.5.2 Verifiable and Measurable Indicators

Verifiable/measurable indicators and anticipated risks and proposed ways of mitigating them were not proposed.

2.6 Pilot Projects

The following pilot projects were proposed:

Water

Construction of New Jimeta Water Supply Scheme
Construction of Maiha Water Supply Scheme for Semi Urban
Provision of 20 Number Hand Pumps in 20 villages
Provision of 50 Number Hand dug wells in 50 villages

Power

Electrification of 3 communities one in each of the senatorial Districts

Youth Program

Bee Farming and Keeping
Rehabilitation of Stadium
Construction of Youth Centres and Development of Youth Empowerment Program
Introduction of Computer Education in 42 Post Primary Schools

The concept of pilot projects is yet to be understood. The projects proposed are too many. They are long-term capital-intensive projects that may take too long to impact positively on the lives of the citizenry. They therefore defeat the purpose for implementing pilot projects which should be practical to implement, so that some improvement to people's lives can be achieved and publicized quickly and relevant to the achievement of a defined policy target.



The implication is that the allocations made to these pilots will further deplete the state's finances at the expense of core programme plans.

3.0 Recommendations and Next Steps

3.1 Recommendations

The shortcomings observed in the ADSEEDS document should be addressed before the zero draft is finalized.

3.2 Next Steps

Consultants should be deployed to the state to provide guidance in addressing all aspects of the review comments. Their Terms of Reference should include a thorough desk review of the document to agree his findings with the findings of this review. This has become necessary because many states have since improved upon the status of their SEEDS beyond the present zero draft level.



Slgp

ANNEX 2

BAUCHI STATE SEEDS REVIEW



Table of Contents

1.0	INTRODUCTION.....	28
1.1	Background	28
1.2	Objective of the Review.....	29
1.3	Approach	29
1.4	Limitations	29
2.0	REVIEW OF BAUCHI STATE SEEDS	29
2.1	Profile of Bauchi State.....	29
2.2	Policy.....	30
2.2.1	Priority Linkages and Disparities between NEEDS and SEEDS	30
2.2.2	Situational Analysis, Policy Thrusts, Targets and Strategies	30
2.2.3	Whether Timelines for Targets is Realistic SME	32
2.2.4	Priority Areas that Address MDGs.....	35
2.2.5	Gender Mainstreaming.....	36
2.3	Budget and Financing	36
2.3.1	Revenue and Revenue Sources.....	36
2.3.2	Spending Distribution Costed by Capital and Recurrent Expenditure ...	37
2.3.3	Spending Priorities and Gain.....	38
2.3.4	Funding Plan among Stakeholders	38
2.3.5	Funding Gaps and Solutions	38
2.4	Implementation.....	38
2.4.1	Institutional Arrangements for Implementation	38
2.4.2	Roles of Stakeholders	39
2.4.3	Specific Risks and Mitigation.....	40
2.4.4	Action Plan	40
2.5	Monitoring and Evaluation.....	40
2.5.1	Mechanisms for Monitoring and Evaluation.....	40
2.5.2	Verifiable and Measurable Indicators	40
2.6	Pilot Projects	41
3.0	RECOMMENDATIONS AND NEXT STEPS.....	41
3.1	Recommendations	41
3.2	Next Steps.....	41



1.0 INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background

The National Planning Commission (NPC) has taken responsibility for developing a State Economic Empowerment and Development Strategy (SEEDS) programme. In the context of NEEDS, and the fact that over fifty-two percent of the federal allocation is distributed to States and Local Governments, it was felt important that there should not just be strategies developed for federal governance improvement, but also for states.

The role of the NPC in developing SEEDS is clearly different from the role of federal ministries in the development of NEEDS. NEEDS is a strategy developed by the Federal Government with a measure of popular involvement. Likewise SEEDS must be developed by State Governments. It is not for NPC to develop it for them. NPC's role is as a facilitator in this process.

In the last one and a half years since the development of SEEDS, all 36 states and the Federal Capital Territory (FCT) have developed their SEEDS document, which are at various stages of preparation. The FCT version of SEEDS is called FEEDS. Despite this there is very little knowledge of what the SEEDS documents are proposing, whether they are achievable and what they mean for Federal Government's ability to develop a coordinated development agenda through the NEEDS/SEEDS program.

The NPC has also embarked on a benchmarking exercise from 6th June. 29 of the 36 states volunteered themselves to be part of this exercise. The process was organized around four benchmarks, which are meant to test the quality of each state's SEEDS. It is anticipated that the exercise will result in a scoring and ranking of the states. FG and donors plan to use the results of this exercise to identify states that can receive additional project support as best performers and states that will receive technical support to advance to a level where they can qualify for project support.

It is also expected that this exercise will also put the states in a position to focus on areas of improvement, which may mean further revision of their SEEDS. In anticipation of this the NPC has drafted a revised version of the SEEDS manual to provide more detailed guidance on how to make each state's SEEDS more effective. Also, NPC thinks it is important to begin to review all the state SEEDS so as to develop a knowledge base that can help in their dialogue with the states and national development objectives. This will also help NPC in any plans to revise NEEDS, which it hopes can leverage off state SEEDS and provide a more uniform and efficient national development agenda.

It is against this background that the Economic Adviser and Chief Executive of the NPC has approved for a team of NPC staff supported by national consultants to review all the SEEDS documents and build a knowledge base of what the SEEDS documents are proposing and how they affect the country's development objectives.



1.2 Objective of the Review

The objective of the review is to build a knowledge base of what Bauchi State SEEDS (BASEEDS) document is proposing and how it affects the country's development objectives.

1.3 Approach

The approach employed was a desk review of BASEEDS and building a knowledge base on its proposals using some specified key variables. These variables ultimately formed the basis of comparing all the states in the Northeast zone.

1.4 Limitations

Some of the prints were blurred constituting visual impediment. There is reason to believe that a second volume of the document existed elsewhere, which was not available at the time of review. Time for the review of the five documents was considered too short.

2.0 REVIEW OF BAUCHI STATE SEEDS

2.1 Profile of Bauchi State

The present Bauchi State, created in 1996, is predominantly a rural State. About 84% and 16% of the population live in rural and urban, respectively. It is made up of 20 Local Governments. The State covers a total land area of 49,259.01 square kilometers representing about 5.3% of Nigeria's total land mass and bordered by seven States; Kano and Jigawa to the north; Taraba and Plateau to the south; Gombe and Yobe to the east and Kaduna to the west.

The State has a total of 55 ethnic groups. The main ones being Hausa, Fulani, Gerawa, Sayawa, Jarawa, Bolawa, Kare-kare, Warjawa, Zulawa and Badawa.

Bauchi State is one of the States in Northern Nigeria spanning two distinct ecological zones; namely, the Sudan Savannah and the Sahel. A number of rivers, which include Gongola and Jama'are along with the various fadama areas in the State, provide suitable land for agricultural activities including fishing, crop production and livestock. These are further supported by a number of dams meant for irrigation and other purposes such as the Gubi, and Galala dams. Lakes like the Maladumba, Diya etc provide the necessary conditions that support agriculture.

Agriculture is the mainstay of the economy of the state and makes it possible for about 75-80% of its indigenes to engage in food and cash crop farming. The major crops produced include cotton, maize, groundnut, millet guinea corn and rice.

Bauchi State is also tremendously rich in tourism potentials. Apart from the famous Yankari Game Reserve, there are 50 other identified attractions.

The State is blessed with largely untapped mineral resources. Large deposits of cassiterite (tin ore) are known to exist in various parts of the State. Large deposits of limestone, gypsum, antimony, iron ore, gold, marble, columbite, zinc and petroleum related deposits have also been found in parts of the State. Precious stones such as sulphur, ametise, aquamarine etc also exist.



The projected population based on 1991 population figures and a growth rate of 3.0 per annum is 4.2million in 2004. This represents 3.26% of Nigeria’s population. An important feature of the population is the near balanced distribution of male 50.5% and 49.5% female.

Another important relevant feature of Bauchi State's population is the predominance of young people, with the age bracket of 0-19 years being 55.4% of the population.

The 20-64 year age group that constitutes the economically active population (EAP) is 41.2% of the State's population. With a population of 4.2million in 2004, it means the state has an EAP of some 1.72 million. The 64 years and above age bracket is 3.4% of the population.

2.2 Policy

2.2.1 Priority Linkages and Disparities between NEEDS and SEEDS

NEEDS	Bauchi SEEDS
<u>Empowering People:</u> Health, education, environment, integrated rural development, housing development, employment and youth development, safety nets, gender and geopolitical balance, and pension reforms	Agriculture, Health, Education, Housing, environment, Safety Nets, Gender issues, and natural resource
<u>Promoting private enterprise:</u> Security and rule of law, infrastructure, finance, sectoral strategies, privatization and liberalization, trade, regional integration, and globalization	SME, security, investment friendly climate
<u>Changing the way the government does its work:</u> Public sector reforms, privatization and liberalization, governance, transparency and anticorruption, service delivery, budget, and expenditure reforms	Public Sector Reforms, Service Delivery, Governance, Transparency and Anti- Corruption, Budget and Expenditure Reforms

Bauchi State SEEDS covered all the priority areas of NEEDS in empowering people, promotion of private enterprises and changing the way government does its works. There are strong priority linkages between the State Policy Targets as contained in the SEEDS document and NEEDS.

There was no comprehensive program on privatisation of state owned enterprises.

2.2.2 Situational Analysis, Policy Thrusts, Targets and Strategies

Agriculture: Low output and low income for farmers; 74 forest reserves, 17 yet to be gazetted; 800 tractors procured by government, 26,000 metric tonnes of fertilizer

SME: Poor SME profile in Bauchi State. Inability to link Agriculture to SME development



Slgp

Education: 1,276,464 primary schools, 481,553 females, Number of Teachers 1,434, Teacher: Pupil ratio 1:88. Secondary School Population 96,768, female 27,252 and 1981 teachers translating into teachers Pupil ratio of 1:49. Literacy rate is 64%

Health: Poor personnel profile, 2,263 staff, 142 core medical staff, 1 surgeon and 3 consultants. 522 Nursing Staff, Nurse Patient Ratio 1:40, Maternal Mortality 1500 deaths per 100,000, infant mortality 79 per 1000 births, Child mortality 104 per 1000 births and Life expectancy of 52 years

Water: Two rivers, 100 000 hectares of irrigable land, six hours of running water in a day and four days in a week

Power: 204 Town and Villages and Local Government have electricity

HIV/AIDS: 4.2% prevalence rate

Environment: 91,250 tons of waste generated from about 500,000 inhabitants in Bauchi. Waste management is a problem

Transport and Housing; 119.630 km of roads and dual carriage fully resurfaced, 1,000 uncompleted house acquired from FHA at Gubi and Tambari; 955 completion, N1.5 billion spent in acquisition

Culture and Tourism: Yankari Game reserve, Burra/Larne Game reserve and bird sanctuary at Wabu

Agriculture: There is a linkage between the states policy thrust of maximizing food production and improving food sufficiency, which will in turn provide employment, minimize rural urban migration, create wealth for the citizenry and reduce environmental degradation with availability of cultivable land and dynamic workforce. The strategies enunciated will achieve the set targets.

SME: The policy thrust designed to be private sector driven will encourage the growth of SME in the state. The strategies set will drive the target.

Education: The education policy thrust and target took into consideration the state of education in the state. The focus is on achieving high transitional level from primary to secondary and from secondary to tertiary.

Health: The policy thrust to improve the quality of health care and reduce the cost of health care delivery aligns with the targets and the situation of health in the state. The strategies were designed to drive the target of increasing number of health personnel in the state that will influence the quality of health care.

Water: The focus to rehabilitate broken down motorized and hand pump boreholes properly aligns with the targets and strategies.

Power: The target to reach out to towns that do not have electricity focuses on the policy thrust and the power situation in the state.



HIV/AIDS: The prevalence rate of 4.8%, which is not far away from the national average, aligns with the target to reduce it to 3.0% and slow the rate of infection.

Environment: The policy thrust to maintain a clean environment and the targets and strategic imperatives to address them will reverse the trend of poor waste management in Bauchi State.

Transport and Housing: The Policy thrust to provide decent and affordable housing aligns with the targets and strategies to achieve them. This will ameliorate housing problem in the state.

Solid Minerals: The policy thrust to provide an enabling environment for private sector involvement align with the programme to harness the solid mineral potentials of the state.

Culture and Tourism: The Policy thrust to promote and harness tourism potentials of the state aligns with the natural endowments in the state as represented by Yankari game reserve and the bird sanctuary. The targets set will be driven by the strategy.

2.2.3 Whether Timelines for Targets is Realistic SME

- To encourage private investment in all sectors of the Bauchi State economy especially in solid minerals and tourism
- Establish five small-scale industries in each of the 20 Local Government Areas in the State by the end of the year 2007.
- To enlarge market outlets for the sale of finished products of the small-scale industries

Comments: Target 1 and 3 are not measurable. Target 2 is Specific, Measurable and Timebound.

Education

- To raise the literacy level from 64% in 2004 to 76% by 2007
- To attain a transition level from 25% to 50% and from 5% to 25% from primary school to secondary school to tertiary institution for student in educational institution by 2007

Comment: Targets 1 and 2 are measurable, timebound and realistic.

Health

- Reduce the infant mortality rate from 79 per 1,000 live births to 50 per 1,000 live births over the current plan period (2004-2007).
- Reduce the maternal mortality rate from 1,500 deaths per 100,000 live births to 1,000 per 100,000 live births between now and 2007.
- Improve institutional capacity of health care facilities at all levels within the state for better and efficiency at health care delivery.
- Build up work force capacity at all levels of care.
- Improve access of the citizens to health care
- Attain universal access to primary healthcare.

Comments: Targets one and two are measurable, specific, time bound and realistic. However, targets 3, 4, 5 & 6 are not measurable.



Water

- Rehabilitation of 1,881 broken-down motorised and hand-pump boreholes by 2005
- Establishment of community maintenance system in 1,881 Communities by 2005
- Provide necessary tools and equipment to the communities in training of community members by 2005
- Carry out expansion of Gubi treatment plant by 2005.

Comments: Targets are well streamlined, specific, measurable and achievable.

Power

- Connect all village areas with electricity where this does not exist by 2005.
- Step-down electricity to all communities along electricity transmission line that connect major towns with electricity by 2007

Comments: Targets are realistic, specific, time bound and measurable.

Roads

- Complete rehabilitation of township roads by 2007 in all the major urban centers, which include all Local Government headquarters.
- Provide drainage system of all the urban roads in the mentioned urban centers.
- Construct 2Km of asphalt roads in all Local Government Headquarters in the State by 2005-2007.
- Construct 15km rural roads in all the LGs in the State by 2005-2007.

Comments: Targets are realistic, measurable, specific and timebound.

Agriculture

- 9 million seedlings at 450,000 seedlings per Local Government Area for Gum Arabic
- 1 million trees to be planted every year in the next four years

Comments: Targets are specific and time bound. The Feasibility of achieving Target 2 is not attainable.

Environment

- Planting of one million trees every year for the next four years
- The gazette of the 17 Forest Reserves including new ones
- Review of inventory of forest resources in the state
- Establishment of shelterbelts
- Development of alternative sources of energy to protect forest resources, e.g. the use of coal for cooking instead of firewood, development of woodlot for supply of firewood's and supply of cheap gas for cooking and supply of solar energy
- Development of forest covers for Gubi and other dams.
- Develop and sustain municipal solid waste and liquid waste
- Disposal mechanisms in accordance with the United Nations
- Standard to achieve environmentally clean cities and rural areas.
- Comment: Target is not timebound and measurable and therefore not realistic.



Safety Nets for Vulnerable Group

- Identify different categories of vulnerable groups that are specific to the state by 2005.
- Identify the needs of the groups and implement programmes as from 2006
- Comment: Target is realistic and measurable.

Youths

- Reduction in youth unemployment by creating 5,000 employment opportunities over the planned period to 2007
- Entrepreneurship training and start up capital for 200 graduates per annum
- Use sports as a tool for gainful employment for the youths. Open up additional source of Internally Generated Revenue for the State, and as a means of leaving a healthy and fit society

Comments: Targets 1 and 2 are time bound. Target 3 is not measurable and timebound.

Gender

- Gender equality
- Greater women empowerment
- Child protection

Comments: Targets are not measurable, timebound and realistic

Housing

- Decent, affordable housing for the populace. 'A roof on every head' by the year 2007
- Completion and sale of 1000 units of houses by the end of 2005;
- Development of digital master plans for all cities in Bauchi State by the end of 2005
- Comments: Targets 1 are not realistic. Target 2 and 3 are measurable and time bound.

HIV/AIDS

- Reduce prevalence rates of HIV/AIDS from 4.8% to 3.0% or less by 2007
- Provide adequate care and support for those i.e. infected People Living with HIV/AIDS (PLWHA) in the State
- Mitigate the impact of People Affected by AIDS (PABAS)
- Strengthen the capacity of State Action Committee on Aids to better respond to the challenge
- To reduce incident of mother to child transmission by 50% among pregnant mother by 2007

Comment: Targets are measurable, time bound and realistic

Information Technology

- Position Bauchi State as an Information Technology (IT) Capable State in competes in the global information society
- Provide a pool of trained IT personnel in the state so that Bauchi State becomes the first port of call for local and foreign investors in the IT industry in Nigeria
- Create an Information System to create an easy access to Government information



Comments: Targets are not measurable and time bound.

Tourism

- Increase inflow of tourist by 2% annually from 2005-2007

Comment: Target is realistic but not aggressive. They are measurable and time bound.

Overall Comments:

SEEDS document does not give current indices, thus making it difficult to determine whether stated targets are realistic.

2.2.4 Priority Areas that Address MDGs

MDGs	Bauchi State
1. Eradicate extreme poverty and hunger	The program to encourage acquisition of skills by youths and access to credit clearly focuses on eradicating extreme poverty and hunger.
2. Achieve Universal Primary Education	Priority areas of developing primary education and improving teacher pupil ratio meets MDG goal 2 of achieving universal primary education
3. Promote Gender Equality and Empower Women	Programs to promote gender equality are not quite aggressive.
4. Reduce Child Mortality	The health priority focuses on reducing child mortality rate from 79 per 1000 to 50
5. Improve Maternal Health	The target to Reduce the maternal mortality rate from 1,500 deaths per 100,000 live births to 1,000 per 100,000 live births between now and 2007 addresses MDG goal 5
6. Combat HIV/AIDS, Malaria and Other Diseases	The policy trust and targets to reduce HIV prevalence rate from 4.85 to 3.0% and provide succour to PLWA partly meets MDG goals. There was no clear mention of how to combat malaria.
7. Ensure environmental Sustainability	The States program on environment meets MDG goals
8. Develop a global partnership for development	The States collaboration with Donor Agencies like UNDP, DFID, CIDA, UNICEF and the World Bank qualifies them for meeting this MDG goal



2.2.5 Gender Mainstreaming

The Bauchi State SEEDS identified the need to achieve 25% female employees out of the total workforce in the state public sector, which is laudable. There are no clear strategies on how to achieve this target.

The document further identified women as one of the vulnerable group and recommended affirmative action programme to increase their representation to at least 30% in education, adult education, and scholarship, access to credit and land, maternal and child health. However, the document did not articulate how to mainstream gender issues in the aforementioned priority sectors with clear-cut policy statements, targets and strategies to synchronize the goals.

2.3 Budget and Financing

2.3.1 Revenue and Revenue Sources

Revenue projections were made from 2005-2007 forming the basis for expenditure projections to finance the strategies. Revenue projections for the three-year period (2005-2007) amounted to N92.1bn. The Revenue sources (FAAC, IGR, loans, etc) were identified.

Assumptions for revenue projections are:

- Federal Statutory Allocation projection for 2006 and 2007 will remain the same with that of 2005, which was based on actual collection for 2004. This is conservative enough and therefore acceptable.
- An increase of 50% was projected for the period 2005-2007 for VAT. The basis for this projection was not made available and therefore could either be realistic or not.
- IGR contributes about 10% of government activities in the past and 25% increase in IGR collection was projected for 2006, while the same figure of 2006 was to be maintained for 2007. The basis for deciding on this growth rate for these projections was not made available neither had ways of improving upon IGR during the period been clearly presented.

The IGR assumption was based on the state's realization that its financial status in terms of stability has been weak with average internal revenue of 10% of total revenue and the target set for raising the level has been proposed as follows:

- Make internally generated revenue contribute 18% to 20% of total recurrent revenue in 2005.
- Contribute not less than 30% of recurrent revenue in 2006 and 2007 to internally generated revenue.
- Finance not less than 25% of recurrent expenditure from internally generated revenue beginning from 2006.

Strategies proposed to shore up the level of IGR during the plan period are as follows:

- Setting up of a revenue monitoring committee in the State to monitor on monthly basis, internally generated revenue other than taxes.
- Revitalizing weak revenue structures through provision of vehicles, personnel and materials.
- Printing of all revenue bearing receipts by security printers. Additional security should be inserted for control.



- Appointment of revenue collectors by name and designation for all areas of revenue listed in the estimates.
- Imposition of heavy sanctions for misappropriation and failure to remit collected revenue.
- Introduction of award for good performance in revenue collection.
- Creation of more revenue collection outlets in selected Local Governments.
- Establishment of Revenue Courts in the State to try tax defaulters.
- A State working committee to look at the printing of the security document and the remitting of pay as you earn (PAYE) within 30 days from the date of deduction. Checks and balances to be properly imposed.

Backed by strong executive and political commitments these measures are capable of raising the level of IGR but they are not enough bases for the assumptions made above.

Emerging Queries and Issues

- A disaggregating of the state IGR into component revenue sources has not been done.
- Basis for revenue projections (i.e. growth rates for each source of revenue curled from past performances) were however not available. Hence, it becomes difficult to say whether the revenue projections are realistic or not.
- The link between IGR historical data and its projections cannot be established.

In conclusion, the revenue projections are not likely to be realistic.

2.3.2 Spending Distribution Costed by Capital and Recurrent Expenditure

Spending distribution for the period was costed by capital and recurrent although the State budget was not shown. No indication that costs were assigned to the policy targets and also no conscious efforts have been made to identify those recurrent costs that are developmental in nature.

Table 2 summarizes the revenue projections against sectoral investment costs from 2005-2007. Revenue projections for the three-year (2005-2007) amounted to N92.1bn while expenditure for the period amounted to N106.5bn.

Year	Total Revenue	Expenditure			Funding Gap
		Capital	Recurrent	Total	
2005	92.1	21.5	40.6	106.5	14.4
2006		22.6			
2007		21.7			
Total	92.1	65.8	40.6	106.5	14.4



2.3.3 Spending Priorities and Gain

Sectoral spending priorities were identified. Six top priorities in descending order of spending during the plan period 2005-2007, include:

- payment of entitlements - 24.53%,
- access to towns and villages - 21.86%,
- priority projects - 7.30%,
- access to safe drinking water - 7.10%,
- basic social services - 6.70%
- Universal Basic Education - 5.42%

Priority gains were not quantified in annual aggregates and therefore state plans for such gains have not been articulated. However a 5% decrease in total overhead cost is expected in 2005. Similarly, a 10% decrease is assured in 2007 from 2006 estimates. Other savings should emerge from ghost workers elimination, right sizing and voluntary severance, transparency and due process in procurement and contracting and project monitoring and evaluation, privatization policy, etc.

2.3.4 Funding Plan among Stakeholders

A cost sharing strategy (e.g. LGAs, PPP, NGOs, Donors) has not been distinctly articulated in the State strategy document.

2.3.5 Funding Gaps and Solutions

Costing of priority areas was done. A balance budget has not been achieved as State expenditure is outside the confines of the resource envelope. State resources cannot adequately finance the development strategies. Considering expenditure size of **N106.5bn** when compared with projected revenue of **N92.1bn**, the funding gap stood at **N14.4bn**.

Funding of this gap is expected to come from external support. The Bauchi State Government proposes to organize a State Economic and Investment Summit towards mobilizing funds to part finance the implementation of the reform agenda and inviting investors to massively invest in the State with a view to achieving sustainable economic growth and Development

2.4 Implementation

2.4.1 Institutional Arrangements for Implementation

A State implementation Committee was set up comprising of some members of state Executive Council, some members of the State House of Assembly, some representatives of Local Government Chairmen, members of the Organized Private Sector, Non Government Organizations (NGOs), Civil Society Organizations (CSOs) and the traditional institution.



A sector wide approach to programme implementation was proposed. Working groups are to be established to assist implementing agencies in executing planned activities and providing oversight functions during implementation. The groups cover all sectors of the state economy. For example, a working group on quick dispensation of justice is one of such, to consist of the Secretary to the State Government, Honourable Commissioners of Land and Survey, Women Affairs and Social Development and Justice (who are lawyers in the State Executive Council), the Judiciary, Police, Prisons and Directorate of Security Services.

18 working groups have so far been identified. A table showing the various 18 working groups and their focal areas as well as their compositions was provided in the document.

The state further proposes that in addition to the State implementation Committee, regular stakeholders meeting will be institutionalized at various levels of implementation (both local and State levels).

To further strengthen the implementation of BASEEDS, there would have to be legislative interventions where required.

An effective communication strategy will be utilized to educate the people of Bauchi State on the development programmes enunciated in BASEEDS. The communication strategy will involve the following activities:

- Massive education and creation through public enlightenment campaigns as well as seminars and workshops to stakeholders and the generality of the people.
- Production and publication of a reader friendly handbook on the policy thrust and strategies of BASEEDS for wide distribution to all stakeholders, etc.

Executive capacities of relevant government agencies of which interventions will be carried out were also critically examined. Based on this critical examination, it was discovered that most of the important structures were found to be weak and needed to be strengthened both in terms of personnel and equipment. To this end, there is need for intensive across the board local and overseas training and re-training of personnel in the State Civil service. The office of the Head of Civil Service is to work out a two-year training master plan for the service.

Basic working materials such as typewriters, computer system, photocopiers, paper shredders, filing cabinets and safes in addition to office furniture have to be procured.

2.4.2 Roles of Stakeholders

No mention was made of why a state implementation committee was to be setup, its roles and responsibilities should be, mode of operation, frequency of meeting and whom it should report to.

A critical inspection of the composition of the working groups revealed that a wider stakeholder approach has been adopted which makes the implementation framework adequate. The state has not mentioned what agency should be coordinating the activities and what the reporting lines should be. A graphical illustration should however be used in bringing out institutional linkages.



The regular stakeholders' meeting proposed to happen at various levels of implementation (both local and State levels) is equally adequate but the rationale for this has to be brought to the fore in the document.

Issues to legislate on or against were not stated even though we are aware of so many of them around us.

It is possible to identify in BASEEDS critical issues if not backed by legislation could impede effective implementation e.g. it could be difficult to implement a strategy that seeks to ensure that all primary school age children are in school If not backed by legislation.

The communication strategies could be extended to the use of state radio and television as well as the state website, if any.

2.4.3 Specific Risks and Mitigation

Specific risks and mitigating factors have not been identified

2.4.4 Action Plan

Defined action plan has not been supplied.

2.5 Monitoring and Evaluation

2.5.1 Mechanisms for Monitoring and Evaluation

A joint monitoring and evaluation committee was proposed to be constituted involving all relevant stakeholders.

More stakeholders beyond the 18 working committees and those in the public service are proposed to be involved in the conduct of monitoring and evaluation. Representatives of development partners, Non-Governmental Organisations (NGOs), Civil Society Organisations (CSOs), Community Based Organisations (CBOs), labour union, student union, religious groups, traditional institutions and Organised Private Sectors (OPSs) will also be involved in the monitoring and evaluation of BASEED Programmes. This will be in addition to the representatives of relevant government Ministries and Agencies. The composition of joint monitoring committees will vary from time to time depending on the specific programmes to be addressed.

This institutional arrangement is adequate. However more work needs to be done in the organization and management of the various groups to make their work more coordinated and effective. Also, responsibilities of the various groups assigned to focal areas including reporting needs to be spelt out clearly. Specific risks and mitigating factors have not been identified while defined action plan has not been supplied.

2.5.2 Verifiable and Measurable Indicators

Verifiable and measurable indicators were not proposed.



2.6 Pilot Projects

The following are the pilot projects identified:

- Promotion of selected export crops e.g. Cassava, Soya Beans etc; one selected crop per annum (a short-term measure for wealth creation).
- Promotion of selected food crops e.g. Rice, Guinea Corn and Maize (short term measure to fight hunger and long term measure to ensure food security).
- Shelter Belt Gum Arabic project (long term measure for wealth creation).
- Establishment of cottage industries (at least one per Local Government).
- Promotion of Tourism in the State and takeover of Yankari Game Reserve from the Federal Government and its immediate redevelopment.
- Drilling of three new motorized boreholes fitted with 15m height overhead tank + reticulation in each of the 20 Local Government Areas.
- Construction of 15Km rural roads in each of the 20 Local Government Areas.

Only items 1-4 are potential pilot projects. However it is not clear in what form these will be implemented quickly to impact on the people. For instance, cassava production would take nine months before harvest time and it puts heavy input demand pressure on farmers unless subsidized by government. The state may have to identify suitable pilots based on its concepts.

3.0 RECOMMENDATIONS AND NEXT STEPS

3.1 Recommendations

The shortcomings observed in the BASEEDS document should be addressed before the zero draft is finalized.

3.2 Next Steps

Consultants should be deployed to the state to provide guidance in addressing all aspects of the review comments. Their Terms of Reference should include a thorough desk review of the document to agree his findings with the findings of this review. This has become necessary because many states have since improved upon the status of their SEEDS beyond the present zero draft level.



Slgp

ANNEX 3

BORNO STATE SEEDS REVIEW



Table of Contents

1.0	INTRODUCTION	44
1.1	Background.....	44
1.2	Objective of the Review	45
1.3	Approach and Methodology	45
1.4	Limitations.....	45
2.0	REVIEW OF BORNO STATE SEEDS.....	45
2.1	Profile of Borno State.....	45
2.2	Policy	46
2.2.1	Priority Linkages and Disparities between NEEDS and SEEDS	46
2.2.2	Situational Analysis, Policy Thrusts, Targets and Strategies	46
2.2.3	Whether Timelines for Targets are Realistic.....	48
2.2.4	Priority Areas that Address MDGs.....	52
2.2.5	Gender Mainstreaming	52
2.3	Budget and Financing.....	52
2.3.1	Revenue and Revenue Sources	52
2.3.2	Spending Distribution Costed by Capital and Recurrent Expenditure	53
2.3.3	Spending Priorities and Gain	53
2.3.4	Funding Plan among Stakeholders.....	53
2.3.5	Funding Gaps and Solutions.....	53
2.4	Implementation	53
2.4.1	Institutional Arrangements for Implementation	53
2.4.2	Roles of Stakeholders.....	54
2.4.3	Specific Risks and Mitigation	54
2.4.4	Action Plan.....	54
2.5	Monitoring and Evaluation	54
2.5.1	Mechanisms for Monitoring and Evaluation	54
2.5.2	Verifiable and Measurable Indicators.....	54
2.6	Pilot Projects	54
3.0	RECOMMENDATIONS AND NEXT STEPS.....	54
3.1	Recommendations.....	54
3.2	Next Steps	54



1.0 INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background

The National Planning Commission (NPC) has taken responsibility for developing a State Economic Empowerment and Development Strategy (SEEDS) programme. In the context of NEEDS, and the fact that over fifty-two percent of the federal allocation is distributed to States and Local Governments, it was felt important that there should not just be strategies developed for federal governance improvement, but also for states.

The role of the NPC in developing SEEDS is clearly different from the role of federal ministries in the development of NEEDS. NEEDS is a strategy developed by the Federal Government with a measure of popular involvement. Likewise SEEDS must be developed by State Governments. It is not for NPC to develop it for them. NPC's role is as a facilitator in this process.

In the last one and a half years since the development of SEEDS, all 36 states and the Federal Capital Territory (FCT) have developed their SEEDS document, which are at various stages of preparation. The FCT version of SEEDS is called FEEDS. Despite this there is very little knowledge of what the SEEDS documents are proposing, whether they are achievable and what they mean for Federal Government's ability to develop a coordinated development agenda through the NEEDS/SEEDS program.

The NPC has also embarked on a benchmarking exercise from 6th June. Twenty-nine of the 36 states volunteered themselves to be part of this exercise. The process was organized around four benchmarks, which are meant to test the quality of each state's SEEDS. It is anticipated that the exercise will result in a scoring and ranking of the states. FG and donors plan to use the results of this exercise to identify states that can receive additional project support as best performers and states that will receive technical support to advance to a level where they can qualify for project support.

It is also expected that this exercise will also put the states in a position to focus on areas of improvement, which may mean further revision of their SEEDS. In anticipation of this the NPC has drafted a revised version of the SEEDS manual to provide more detailed guidance on how to make each state's SEEDS more effective. Also, NPC thinks it is important to begin to review all the state SEEDS so as to develop a knowledge base that can help in their dialogue with the states and national development objectives. This will also help NPC in any plans to revise NEEDS, which it hopes can leverage off state SEEDS and provide a more uniform and efficient national development agenda.

It is against this background that the Economic Adviser and Chief Executive of the NPC has approved for a team of NPC staff supported by national consultants to review all the SEEDS documents and build a knowledge base of what the SEEDS documents are proposing and how they affect the country's development objectives.



1.2 Objective of the Review

The objective of the review is to build a knowledge base of what Borno State SEEDS (BOSEEDS) documents is proposing and how it affects the country's development objectives.

1.3 Approach and Methodology

The approach employed was a desk review of BOSEEDS and building a knowledge base on its proposals using some specified key variables. These variables ultimately formed the basis of comparing all the states in the Northeast zone.

1.4 Limitations

Some of the prints were blurred constituting visual impediment. There is reason to believe that a second volume of the document existed elsewhere, which was not available at the time of review. Time for the review of the five documents was considered too short.

2.0 REVIEW OF BORNO STATE SEEDS

2.1 Profile of Borno State

The State was created out of the defunct Northeastern state in 1976 and further subdivided into two in 1991 when Yobe state was carved out of it to form the present state. It has a land area of 69,435sq.km.

The population of the state is 3.5million and its population density stands at 37 persons per square kilometer. Twenty-six of the languages spoken are classified by linguists as Chadic languages. There are 27 local Government Areas, seven emirate councils and three senatorial districts in the state.

According to the 1991 population census, the population structure depicts the following picture:

The people in the 0-19 age group are 1.3million out of 2.5million, which is about 52.6% while those in the 70-85 age bracket are 0.056million, out of 2.5million, which is about 2.2% of the total of the state. Those two age groups constitute about 54.8% of the total population of the state. The people in the age group 20-69 are 1.14million out of 2.5million, which is about 45.14% of the total population of the state.

By implication the age groups 0-19 and 70-85, which makes about 58.6% of the total population, are dependant on age group 20-69 which is about 45.1%. Such scenario does not augur well for economic development because resources are thinly distributed among the people with its serious consequence on living standards of the people.

The state outline is devoid of very important planning parameters and information like literacy rates, HIV AIDS, mineral and natural resources etc.



2.2 Policy

2.2.1 Priority Linkages and Disparities between NEEDS and SEEDS

NEEDS	Borno SEEDS
<p><u>Empowering People</u>: Health, education, environment, integrated rural development, housing development, employment and youth development, safety nets, gender and geopolitical balance, and pension reforms</p>	<p>Agriculture, Health, Education, Housing, environment, Safety Nets, Gender issues, and natural resource</p>
<p><u>Promoting private enterprise</u>: Security and rule of law, infrastructure, finance, sectoral strategies, privatization and liberalization, trade, regional integration, and globalization</p>	<p>SME, Privatization of SOEs, security, investment friendly climate</p>
<p><u>Changing the way the government does its work</u>: Public sector reforms, privatization and liberalization, governance, transparency and anticorruption, service delivery, budget, and expenditure reforms</p>	<p>Public Sector Reforms, Service Delivery, Governance, Transparency and Anti-Corruption, Budget and Expenditure Reforms</p>

Borno State SEEDS covered all the priority areas of NEEDS in empowering people, promotion of private enterprises and changing the way government does its works. There are strong priority linkages between the State Policy Targets as contained in the SEEDS document and NEEDS.

A critical review of the policy thrusts requires streamlining of the policy targets to match resources and revenue base of the state under the Medium Term Expenditure framework.

2.2.2 Situational Analysis, Policy Thrusts, Targets and Strategies

- **Agriculture**: 70% of the population are farmers. Agriculture the mainstay of the economy. A ton of grain sells at N5,800. The major crops are Soya Beans, Cotton, Groundnuts, Rice, Cassava, Sweet Potatoes, Maize, Wheat, Guinea Corn, Gum Arabic, Vegetables
- **Poverty and Unemployment rate**; High unemployment with 50% of youths unemployed
- **SME**: SME program in the State is weak.
- **Educational Status**: Adult literacy rate is 25%. Two Federal Government Colleges, 87 Post Primary, one school for the blind, two Technical Colleges, five Teachers Colleges, six Vocational Training Centers, 73 Conventional secondary schools.
- **Health**: 800/100,000 births in maternal mortality ratio, infant mortality rate 91/1000, immunization coverage of 70%, Average life expectancy is 52 years, crude death rate-43/1000, Infant mortality rate 91/1000, Maternal Mortality Rate 800/100,000, Doctor/Population ratio 1:16908, Nurse to Population ratio 1:2158
- **Water**: 20% of rural population have access to water, 30% in the urban areas



Slgp

- **Power:** Evenly distributed in the LGAs, hooked to the national grid, Supply is powered with a capacity of 132KV line from Gombe, overloaded conductors, 330 KV line to resolve problem
- **HIV/AIDS:** Prevalence rate is 3.2%
- **Environment:** Erosion, flood, waste management, deforestation, pollution, land degradation and desertification. 3.6% of the people use flush system for disposal, 33% use traditional pit latrines, 44% use open pit, 71% in urban have access to safe drinking water, 48% in rural areas and 10% access to improved sanitation
- **Transport and Housing:** Quantity and quality of housing stock inadequate, budgetary provision low, Private sector position is consistently non-existent, availability and access to land cumbersome
- **Pension and Gratuity Reforms:** A workforce of 29,000 workers. The reform in the past was ineffective
- **Safety Nets for Vulnerable Groups:** Majority of the poor live in rural area, Self help poverty reduction programs, Well coordinated programs
- Limited access to farmland for women with high cost of farm inputs
- **Solid Minerals:** four mineral deposits, 50 different varieties of minerals
- **Culture and Tourism:** State is endowed with natural resorts such as the Sambira game reserve, Sanda Kiyarimi Park, Shehu of Bornos Palace, Rabehs Fort
- **Gender;** Committee on child rates in place, unjust laws that discriminates against women still operational, social and cultural setbacks, widows subjected to dehumanizing condition.
- **Information and Communication Technology:** Obsolete equipment, existence of government owned media houses
- **Good Governance:** Anti corruption policies in place, right sizing and due process mechanism
- **Public Sector Reform:** Due Process and Procurement structures in place
- **Privatization:** 10 functional industries mostly SMEs, SOEs in deteriorating condition with equipment lying redundant

Agriculture: The Agriculture Policy thrust of the state is designed to take advantage of the vast opportunities existing in the Agricultural sector to further create opportunities for both men and women in the state. The strategic themes are designed to create connectivity between agricultural programme and development of small medium enterprises.

SME: The poor industry profile of the state will be addressed by the policy thrust and strategic themes to develop SME in the State.

Educational Status: The educational targets are cumbersome. They are realistic with the facts on ground but may need to be streamlined for better focus.

Health: The health policy thrust is well streamlined and meant to address fundamental issues of maternal mortality and strengthening of skills of health personnel in the state.

Water: The policy thrust to eradicate water borne diseases and improve level of water supply in the state is well articulated. The targets are not specific and may be at variance in dealing with the state of water supply in the state.



Power: The policy thrust to increase the level of power supply to 330 KVA will address the problem of epileptic power supply in the State. The targets are conservative and adequate.

HIV/AIDS: The Policy thrust to control and manage the spread of HIV/AIDS is in conformity with the state of the disease in the State. The targets are specific with requisite strategies to drive it.

Environment: The Policy thrust on the environment aligns with the environmental peculiarities of the state. The targets are specific with the strategic framework to achieve them.

Transport and Housing: The policy targets and thrust to address housing aligns with strategies. The goals and targets are in tandem with the state of housing in the state.

Women, Youth and Child Development: Mainstreaming of gender issues in critical priority sector will empower women to compete in the state. However, the strategies outlined failed to stipulate how gender issues will be synchronized in the socio economic program of the state. The various youth programs will encourage acquisition of skills for job placement in the market place.

Safety Nets for Vulnerable Groups: The policy thrust of inclusiveness in a well-articulated program between the government and the donor agencies will empower the vulnerable groups.

Solid Minerals: The strategies of aggressive private sector involvement in exploring mineral potentials of the state are in tandem with the realities on ground. Resources should be focused on providing social services and infrastructure while private sector investment is critical to progress in the State.

Culture and Tourism: The projections of tourist revenue are conservative since the facilities are yet to be developed. The targets are quite realistic with strategies to drive them

Public Sector Reform and Good Governance: There is a link between the policy thrust to rightsize the civil service, fight corruption and ensure due process in procurement.

Privatization: The policy thrust that will ensure privatisation of SOEs is in line with government plan to operate a private sector growth drive strategy.

2.2.3 Whether Timelines for Targets are Realistic

SME

- Expected large numbers of SMEs envisages it to have increased of 30% output
- Generation of employment opportunities up to 21,000 jobs by 207 at a rate of 7,000 jobs annually
- Attract \$5 Million foreign investment at a growth rate of 5%
- Achieve 15% spread in location of SMEs by 2007
- State government to guarantee SMEs funds for private investors to facilitate early approval



- Achieve significant reduction in poverty index of the state through establishment and operation of Public Private sector

Comment: Private sector involvement in the industrial program of the state as enunciated in the SEEDS document is not aggressive. Targets should focus on the medium term and not go beyond 2007. The framework for developing 20 SMEs per local government is not realistic.

Education

- Increase in school enrolment by 5% annually from 2005 to 2007
- Increase in retention and completion rate in primary schools
- 50% Of primary school teachers to acquire the minimum teaching qualification in line with the National Policy on Education by the end of year 2007
- Establish 12 additional Junior Secondary School by 2007
- Renovation of 12 dilapidated secondary school buildings by the last quarter of 2004
- Rehabilitation of 30 existing laboratory in the secondary schools by 2005
- Procurement and distribution of Science and reagents to 50 secondary schools by 2006
- Increase transition of JSS to SSS by 50% by 2006
- 20% of Secondary School Teachers to be compute literate by 2007
- Ensure accreditation of all academic programmes in tertiary institutions in the state through upgrading of facilities and teaching environment in these institutions
- Increase by 10% current level of scholarship awards to students of state origins annually
- Ensure that 30% of graduates of tertiary institutions are computer literate by 2007
- Ensure that a high percentage of available courses are relevant to the development of the state
- Establish five Almajiris Training Centres in each LG.
- Reduce illiteracy among the adult population in the state including nomadic adults through increased LGA sensitization programme
- Provide extra-mural and continuing education for the adult population;
- Establish and equip 30 Girl Child Non-formal Education Centre by 2007.
- Enforce penalty for withdrawal of girl child from schools
- Increase the tempo of mass mobilization and advocacy of equality of access of education for all children at all levels
- Increase enrolment by 50% and encourage completion of all tiers of education by 2007

Comment: Targets needs to be timebound, streamlined and costed to match resource base of the state.

Health

- Construction of befitting capacity General Hospital by 2006
- Government will establish PHC facilities in the wards where they do not exist by 2006
- Secondary healthcare facilities will be established at least one per local government by 2007
- Completion of three abandoned hospitals and five health centres in 2005
- 80% Coverage to be achieved for all vaccine antigens



Comments: Targets are not specific and timebound.

HIV/AIDS

- To reduce the spread and effect of HIV/AIDS by 10% by year 2005
- Reduce the number of people that die of HIV/AIDS by 40% by 2007
- Provide support and care to about 50% of the people living with HIV/AIDS and their families by 2007
- Reduce the prevalence of HIV/AIDS by 40% by 2007.
- Reduce the number of orphans owing to HIV/AIDS by 50% by 2007
- Rehabilitate at least 2000 people Living with HIV/AIDS every year Starting by 2005

Comments: Targets are specific, realistic, and measurable and time bound.

Water

- Ensuring the development and management of water resources in an integrated manner and as a national strategic resource
- Involving all stakeholders particularly the private sector and NGOs in the sustainable development of water resources through coordinated Management and holistic utilization
- Optimizing the use of water resources at all times for present generation to survive on without compromising water supplies for future generations
- Provision of adequate and affordable water supply services to the State Provision of 150 boreholes to communities across the State by 2007
- Construct overhead and underground reservoir in each tertiary institution by 2005

Comments: Most targets are policy aims. The targets need to be well streamlined, specific, measurable and achievable.

Power

Between 2005 and 2007, at least 50 communities shall be provided by electricity by the rural electrification board

Comments: Targets are realistic and measurable.

Agriculture

- Renew all laws and practise that discriminates against women ownership
- Implement schemes of land preparation services to increase cultivable arable land by 10%
- Create employment opportunities and reduce unemployment by 30% by 2007
- Establish 3 fish hatchery complexes across the state by 2006

Comments: Targets are measurable and timebound.

Environment

- Introduce three Million nursery seedlings in three years
- Establishment of 50 hectares of gum Arabic plantation at Benisheikh and other areas in Northern Borno in 2005 and same for 2006
- Afforest and reforest the degraded arid and semi arid environment by planting shelter belts and wind breakers 500 hectares annually.
- Establish 500 berries farm in 2007
- 30 Shea butter farms to be established annually from 2005-2007



- Construction of flood and erosion structures in Maiduguri in 2005
- Construction of drainage channels and washout bridges and evacuation of drainages in 2005

Comments: Targets are specific, measurable and time bound.

Youth Program

- Develop a State Policy on Youth by December 2005
- Youth involvement in the decision-making processes at all levels by 2006
- Ensure partnership among stakeholders towards collective youth
- Development and poverty reduction schedules by 2006
- Establish a skill acquisition centre for youth empowerment in each LGA by 2006
- State and Local Governments to collaborate on youth development issues by 2005, by creating entrepreneurship development plans
- Establish a special Youth Trust Fund for Youth development activities in the State by 2006
- Sustain partnership with financial institution to provide soft loan by 2006
- Reduce the scourge of HIV/AIDS by mainstreaming family life education in schools and communities by 2005
- Create a conducive atmosphere to use sports to create good atmosphere in LGAs

Comments: Except for the last, the targets are measurable, time bound and realistic.

Safety Nets for Vulnerable Group

- Establish two remand centres by the end of 2005
- Eradicate street begging by 20% annually from 2005 to 2007
- Reduce juvenile crimes by 50%
- Reduce the number of cognitive challenged roaming the streets
- Resettle 20 destitute at rehab centres
- Ensure 75% coverage of child birth by 2007
- Reduce incidence of child orphanage by HIV/AIDS by 50%
- Improve access to basic health and education services and other care

Comment: Targets are realistic, measurable and timebound, except for the target on reducing number of cognitive challenged and access to basic health and education services

Gender

- Eradicate street begging by 20% annually
- BOSEEDS will by the year 2007, increase the integration of women into the mainstream of socio-political and economic life development of Borno State by 30% in all sectors

Housing

- Increase the existing housing stock by 2000 units by the year 2007
- Construction of 20 Housing Units in each of the 27 LGAs
- A budgetary provision of at least 2.5% to be made in annual budget for housing delivery in the state
- Produce strategic plans for urban renewal in all Local Government by 2005
- Develop strategic plans for housing development in every Local Government Headquarters by 2006; housing units in each 27 LGAs



Tourism

- Attract 100,000 foreign tourists to Borno State by 2007
- Earn \$ 500,000 from tourism by 2007
- Create employment opportunities for 5000 people in the sector by 2010

Comment: Targets are measurable and time bound.

Overall Comments:

SEEDS document does not give current indices, thus making it difficult to determine whether stated targets are realistic.

2.2.4 Priority Areas that Address MDGs

States	Borno
MDGs	
1. Eradicate extreme poverty and hunger	The program to encourage acquisition of skills by youths and access to farmland by women clearly focuses on eradicating extreme poverty and hunger.
2. Achieve Universal Primary Education	Priority areas of developing primary education meets MDG goal 2 of achieving universal primary education
3. Promote Gender Equality and Empower Women	The strategies to promote gender equality are clearly stated but lack specific targets. The program did not specify how gender would be mainstreamed in the socio economic activities in the state.
4. Reduce Child Mortality	The health priority focuses on reducing child mortality rate
5. Improve Maternal Health	Priority areas of Health addresses MDG goals 5 of improving maternal health and combating HIV/AIDS
6. Combat HIV/AIDS, Malaria and Other Diseases	The policy trust and targets to reduce HIV prevalence rate and provide support to PLWHA partly meets MDG goals. There was no clear mention of how to combat malaria.
7. Ensure environmental Sustainability	The States program on environment meets MDG goals
8. Develop a global partnership for development	The States collaboration with Donor Agencies qualifies them for meeting this MDG goal

2.2.5 Gender Mainstreaming

The Borno State SEEDS addresses strategies to reduce poverty among women but lacks clear direction of how to mainstream these strategies into the various strategic social and economic sectors in the state.

2.3 Budget and Financing

2.3.1 Revenue and Revenue Sources

Revenue sources (FAAC, IGR, loans and VAT) were identified but neither a table on historical data nor projections into 2007 were available in the report. The prose was also silent on the performance of the various revenue sources. It is therefore not certain about how realistic the figures could be.



2.3.2 Spending Distribution Costed by Capital and Recurrent Expenditure

Costing and projection of priority areas were done. Except for capital allocation to priority sectors, there was no information on recurrent. It is therefore difficult to say whether the costing structure is budgeting compliant or not. Spending distribution for the period was costed by only capital. There was no indication that costs were assigned to the policy targets and also no conscious efforts have been made to identify those recurrent costs that are developmental in nature.

2.3.3 Spending Priorities and Gain

Sectoral spending priorities were identified. Seven foremost priorities in descending order of spending include: Transport, Health, Education, Agriculture and Rural Development, Housing, Youth Empowerment and Water Supply. Priority gains were not quantified in annual aggregates and therefore state plans for such gains have not been articulated. Such savings should emerge from ghost workers elimination, right sizing and voluntary severance, transparency and due process in procurement and contracting and project monitoring and evaluation, privatization policy, etc.

2.3.4 Funding Plan among Stakeholders

A cost sharing strategy (e.g. LGAs, PPP, NGOs, Donors etc) has not been distinctly articulated in the State strategy document. Borno State is one of the least recipients of foreign Direct Assistance of any form among the States in the country. Attempts by previous administrations to attract donor presence in the State have been feeble.

2.3.5 Funding Gaps and Solutions

Funding gap determination is impossible as necessary information to make it possible is not available.

2.4 Implementation

2.4.1 Institutional Arrangements for Implementation

No clearly understood institutional framework for implementation was proposed. However a few complementary implementation strategies were proposed as stated below.

BOSEEDS proposes to enact the relevant laws needed to implement BOSEEDS. Some of the new legislations needed to implement BOSEEDS include fiscal responsibility bill, finance bill, Pension reform, local government reform and public procurement bill.

To further support its implementation strategy, government plans to:

- Employ radio and television, including the production of jingles to keep the message of BOSEEDS alive in the hearts of Borno State people.
- Make regular press releases to inform the people on the progress made and difficulties encountered in implementing BOSEEDS.
- Strive to produce both a popular and school version of the BOSEEDS. The aim is to ensure that all people of Borno State are abreast of the message contained in the BOSEEDS, and therefore are part of the army of monitors keeping government in check and ensuring that the provisions of the programme are implemented.



Communication strategy was mentioned but more work needs to be done in specifying what has to be done.

More work needs to be done in clearly prescribing an institutional framework for implementation of BOSEEDS with graphical illustration to show linkages and reporting lines.

2.4.2 Roles of Stakeholders

These have not been proposed.

2.4.3 Specific Risks and Mitigation

Specific risks and mitigating factors have not been identified

2.4.4 Action Plan

Defined action plan has not been supplied.

2.5 Monitoring and Evaluation

2.5.1 Mechanisms for Monitoring and Evaluation

“Consequently, a clear framework and machinery for monitoring and evaluation programmes and projects have been put in place.” This statement was made on page 185 of the BOSEEDS document. Unfortunately, No mention was made on the institutional framework proposed for the monitoring and evaluation of BOSEEDS.

2.5.2 Verifiable and Measurable Indicators

Verifiable and measurable indicators were not proposed.

2.6 Pilot Projects

No pilot projects were proposed.

3.0 RECOMMENDATIONS AND NEXT STEPS

3.1 Recommendations

The Shortcomings Observed In The Boseeds Document Should Be Addressed Before The Zero Draft Is Finalized.

3.2 Next Steps

Consultants should be deployed to the state to provide guidance in addressing all aspects of the review comments. Their Terms of Reference should include a thorough desk review of the document to agree his findings with the findings of this review. This has become necessary because many states have since improved upon the status of their SEEDS beyond the present zero draft level.



SLGP

ANNEX 4
GOMBE STATE SEEDS REVIEW



Table of Contents

1.0	INTRODUCTION.....	57
1.1	Background	57
1.2	Objective of the Review.....	58
1.3	Approach and Methodology	58
1.4	Limitations	58
2.0	REVIEW OF GOMBE STATE SEEDS.....	58
2.1	Profile of Gombe State	58
2.2	Policy.....	59
2.2.1	Priority Linkages and Disparities between NEEDS and SEEDS	59
2.2.2	Situational Analysis, Policy Thrusts, Targets and Strategies	59
2.2.3	Whether Timelines for Targets are Realistic	62
2.2.4	Priority Areas that Address MDGs.....	65
2.2.5	Gender Mainstreaming.....	65
2.3	Budget and Financing	65
2.3.1	Revenue and Revenue Sources.....	65
2.3.2	Spending Distribution Costed by Capital and Recurrent Expenditure ...	67
2.3.3	Spending Priorities and Gain.....	67
2.3.4	Funding Plan among Stakeholders	67
2.3.5	Funding Gaps and Solutions	67
2.4	Implementation.....	67
2.4.1	Institutional Arrangements for Implementation	67
2.4.2	Roles of Stakeholders	68
2.4.3	Specific Risks and Mitigation.....	68
2.4.4	Action Plan	68
2.5	Monitoring and Evaluation.....	68
2.5.1	Mechanisms for Monitoring and Evaluation.....	68
2.5.2	Verifiable and Measurable Indicators	68
2.6	Pilot Projects	68
3.0	RECOMMENDATIONS AND NEXT STEPS.....	68
3.1	Recommendations	68
3.2	Next Steps.....	68



1.0 INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background

The National Planning Commission (NPC) has taken responsibility for developing a State Economic Empowerment and Development Strategy (SEEDS) programme. In the context of NEEDS, and the fact that over fifty-two percent of the federal allocation is distributed to States and Local Governments, it was felt important that there should not just be strategies developed for federal governance improvement, but also for states.

The role of the NPC in developing SEEDS is clearly different from the role of federal ministries in the development of NEEDS. NEEDS is a strategy developed by the Federal Government with a measure of popular involvement. Likewise SEEDS must be developed by State Governments. It is not for NPC to develop it for them. NPC's role is as a facilitator in this process.

In the last one and a half years since the development of SEEDS, all 36 states and the Federal Capital Territory (FCT) have developed their SEEDS document, which are at various stages of preparation. The FCT version of SEEDS is called FEEDS. Despite this there is very little knowledge of what the SEEDS documents are proposing, whether they are achievable and what they mean for Federal Government's ability to develop a coordinated development agenda through the NEEDS/SEEDS program.

The NPC has also embarked on a benchmarking exercise from 6th June. 29 of the 36 states volunteered themselves to be part of this exercise. The process was organised around four benchmarks, which are meant to test the quality of each state's SEEDS. It is anticipated that the exercise will result in a scoring and ranking of the states. FG and donors plan to use the results of this exercise to identify states that can receive additional project support as best performers and states that will receive technical support to advance to a level where they can qualify for project support.

It is also expected that this exercise will also put the states in a position to focus on areas of improvement, which may mean further revision of their SEEDS. In anticipation of this the NPC has drafted a revised version of the SEEDS manual to provide more detailed guidance on how to make each state's SEEDS more effective. Also, NPC thinks it is important to begin to review all the state SEEDS so as to develop a knowledge base that can help in their dialogue with the states and national development objectives. This will also help NPC in any plans to revise NEEDS, which it hopes can leverage off state SEEDS and provide a more uniform and efficient national development agenda.

It is against this background that the Economic Adviser and Chief Executive of the NPC has approved for a team of NPC staff supported by national consultants to review all the SEEDS documents and build a knowledge base of what the SEEDS documents are proposing and how they affect the country's development objectives.



1.2 Objective of the Review

The objective of the review is to build a knowledge base of what Gombe State SEEDS documents is proposing and how it affects the country's development objectives.

1.3 Approach and Methodology

The approach employed was a desk review of Gombe State SEEDS document and building a knowledge base on its proposals using some specified key variables. These variables ultimately formed the basis of comparing all the states in the Northeast zone.

1.4 Limitations

Some of the prints were blurred constituting visual impediment. There is reason to believe that a second volume of the document existed elsewhere, which was not available at the time of review. Time for the review of the five documents was considered too short.

2.0 REVIEW OF GOMBE STATE SEEDS

2.1 Profile of Gombe State

Gombe State was created out of the former Bauchi State in October 1996. With a land area of 20,265sq.km, its population was projected to 2.17million people in 2004 and has a population density of 89.8 persons per sq.km (1998). The vegetation of the state is generally guinea savannah grassland with concentration of woodlands in the southeast and southwest. It has 11 Local Government Areas and a land area of 20,265sq.km

The State is endowed with rich agricultural land and about 80% of the people are mainly peasant farmers involved in farming food and cash crops such as millet, sorghum, maize, vegetable, cotton and groundnut, through rain-fed as well as irrigation agriculture. Some of the people are also engaged in livestock farming, fishing and craft works. Gombe State has large deposits of solid minerals such as limestone, gypsum, kaolin, silica, talc, uranium and dolomite.

There are slightly more males than females in the State, The sex ratio is 100 males to 98.9 females meaning that the gender composition of the population is almost equally distributed.

Three local governments account for 41.86 percent of the total population: Akko (15.24%), Yamaltu Deba (14.79%) and Gombe (1 1.33%).

The least populated three local governments, however, accounted for 15.21 percent of the headcounts with Shongom (4.37%), Nafada (5.01%) and Billiri (5.83%). About 46 percent of the population belongs to the adolescent group (less than 15 years) while 51 percent fell within the working group (between 15-64 years) and about 3.0 percent belong to the aged group (65 years and above). The demographic structure suggests that for poverty to be reduced special attention needs to be given to creating opportunities to avoid social menace and high dependency ratio. The low proportion of aged tends to suggest relatively low life expectancy at birth for the state – a major indicator of human development index.



The overall estimated crude population density of the state by 1998 was about 89.8 persons per square kilometer.

2.2 Policy

2.2.1 Priority Linkages and Disparities between NEEDS and SEEDS

NEEDS	Gombe SEEDS
<u>Empowering People</u> : Health, education, environment, integrated rural development, housing development, employment and youth development, safety nets, gender and geopolitical balance, and pension reforms	Agriculture, Health, Education, Housing, environment, Safety Nets, Gender issues, and natural resource
<u>Promoting private enterprise</u> : Security and rule of law, infrastructure, finance, sectoral strategies, privatization and liberalization, trade, regional integration, and globalization	SME, Privatization of SOEs, security, investment friendly climate
<u>Changing the way the government does its work</u> : Public sector reforms, privatization and liberalization, governance, transparency and anticorruption, service delivery, budget, and expenditure reforms	Public Sector Reforms, Service Delivery, Governance, Transparency and Anti-Corruption, Budget and Expenditure Reforms

Gombe State SEEDS covered all the priority areas of NEEDS in empowering people, promotion of private enterprises and changing the way government does its works. There are strong priority linkages between the State Policy Targets as contained in the SEEDS document and NEEDS.

A critical review of the policy thrusts could not match the targets stipulated in the document with the resource base of the State. Streamlining of the targets will likely be necessary in the Medium Term Expenditure framework.

2.2.2 Situational Analysis, Policy Thrusts, Targets and Strategies

Agriculture

- Agriculture is the mainstay of the economy with land area of 20,265km² and population of 2.2 Million
- 80% of the population are involved in agriculture
- 945,116 hectares are under cultivation

SME

- SME sector is not active but gradually evolving
- Government is encouraging private sector participation

Education

- Focus on early childhood care and Develop/Nursery Education
- 47 Nursery institutions
- 483,090 enrolled kids in 1030 primary schools, 777 classrooms are in good conditions, 539 classrooms in bad conditions, 9527 teachers, 1006 untrained teachers



Siya

- 145,062 students enrolled in 146 schools, 772 classrooms in good condition
- Adult and Non Formal Education: 87 women centers, 2837 students, 37 girl child, 102 koranic schools, 7780 students, 22 learning centres, 26,750 literacy classes
- Higher Education: State University, Adult Education and Social Development Institute with a staff strength of 67

Health

- Seven Public Hospitals, 12 Primary health centers, 75 clinics, 127 maternity clinics, 180 dispensaries, two private hospitals, 45 private clinics, 448 Health institutions, 4853 people per hospital, 4 1 doctors, 403 nurses, and 17 pharmacists, 19 lab scientists, 20 radiologists, 604 Primary Health Workers and 253 wards
- One doctor per 53,027 and one Nurse per 5,374
- 394 primary healthcare facilities, 1216 trained personnel
- Proportion of Children Immunized: 58% against polio, 26% against tetanus, 18.3% against whooping cough, 9.3% against tuberculosis, 4.7% against CSM, 5.3% against Yellow Fever. On the average, less than 205 were immunized against deadly disease

Water

- Water supply is through mechanized and hand pump borehole systems
- People in remote areas use hand-dug wells.
- 298 water supply schemes are available
- 750 boreholes are available
- Total design capacity for water supply is 105 cubic meters per day
- Deplorable condition of facility ensures that only 10% is available for consumption
- Poor electricity to run boreholes
- Limited funds to purchase fuel for generators
- Poor maintenance of facilities

Power

- 132/33 kV allocated to the North East region from Shiroro. The state has installed capacity of 30 MVA and consumes about 500MWH monthly
- The Local Governments are connected to electricity

HIV/AIDS

- The prevalent rate is 5.0%
- CBOs, CSOs are working with government machinery to control the spread and managed PLWHA

Environment

- Erosion, Flood and Gulleys are the main environmental problems in the state
- Deforestation, Agricultural activities, Increasing human population, bush burning and overgrazing are other problems plaguing the environment in the state

Gender

- 49.5% of the state population is women
- The bulk of the women population is engaged in crop production, livestock, poultry and fisheries.



- 50% are involved in commerce, trade and tourism

Safety Nets for Vulnerable Groups

- 83.5% of the population are poor and live mostly in the rural area
- They are mostly unemployed and vulnerable to HIV/AIDS

Solid Minerals

- Available minerals in the state includes limestone, uranium, columbite, silica, haphites, tourmaline, feldspar, kaolin etc
- There is no policy to develop the sector

Culture and Tourism

- The state is blessed with natural environment: 33 dams and lakes, 19 rivers and streams, 40 forest reserves, 16 wood lots, one medicinal herb reserve
- Topography characterised by mountains attractions abound in all LGs

Public Sector Reforms

- State lacks qualified staff
- State lacks political will
- Lack of discipline in control of the size of recurrent expenditure
- Lack of co-operation between various tiers of government
- Revenue Volatility
- Inadequate exploitation of internal resources

Agriculture: The Agriculture Policy thrust of the state is designed to harness the huge land mass and create an economy for the state. The targets and strategies are aligned with the policy to ensure food security for the state.

SME: The Policy thrust is meant to encourage private sector participation in the state. The poor industry profile of the state will be addressed by the strategies to grow SME.

Education: The policy thrust of Education will consolidate the focus on early childhood and primary education. The strategies and targets are consistent with the policy and the state of education in the state.

Health: The health policy thrust is designed to address the shortcomings in health management in the state. The need to align targets and strategies with resources is crucial to the realization of set goals and objectives.

Water: The policy targets to increase access to clean water and improve the sanitation level in the state are consistent with the strategies and the state of water supply in the state.

Power: The policy thrust to increase the level of power supply will address the problem of epileptic power supply in the State. This is adequate.

HIV/AIDS: The Policy thrust to combat and stop the spread of HIV/AIDS is in tune with the reality on ground. With a prevalence rate of 5.0%, the targets and strategies are aggressive and adequate.



Environment: The Policy thrust was designed to reverse the trend in environmental degradation in the state. The targets and strategies are adequate to address the situation.

Transport and Housing: The policy targets and thrust when synchronize with the strategies will address the transport and housing issues in the SEEDS document.

Pension and Gratuity Reforms: The policy thrust and strategies were designed to clear the backlog of pension arrears in the state. The strategies to checkmate falsification of age in the state civil service are meant to reduce complications in pension management.

Gender: The policy targets and strategies is a reflection of the aggressive posture of the government to address gender inequality and include women in the scheme of things in the state. As a vulnerable group, the targets will address the socio economic imbalances in access to employment, education, and health.

Solid Minerals: There were no clear targets and strategies to grow the sector.

Culture and Tourism: The targets are designed to take advantage of the natural resources in the state.

Privatisation: The policy thrust that will ensure privatisation of SOEs is in line with government plan to operate a private sector growth drive strategy.

2.2.3 Whether Timelines for Targets are Realistic

SME

- Raise capacity of existing industrial outfits by 50% by 2007
- Increase the number of business enterprises by 25% by 2007
- Raise the number of people working in the industrial sector by 50% by 2007

Comment: The targets are not specific on the growth of SME in the state.

Education

- Reduce the gender gap in primary school education by 50% by 2007
- Reduce the spatial distribution of primary schools by 55% by 2007
- Increase the enrolment rate by 20% from its current level of about 60% by 2007
- Increase the capacity of schools to cope with increased enrolment by 25% by 2007
- Increase the quality of certification by 15% by 2007
- Reduce the gender gap in primary school education by 50%
- Increasing secondary school enrolment rate from 51% in 2004 to 65% by 2007
- Reduce the dropout rate from its current 2.43% in 2004 to 1.0% by 2007
- Increase the certification rate by 50% by 2007
- Reducing the gender imbalance in secondary school enrolment, which is currently 52.64%, to 30% by 2007
- Increase transition rate in primary to junior secondary school by 1.5 percent and that of JSS. to SSS by 3.0% by 2006.
- Improve the quality of non-formal education by 20% in 2007



- Increase the enrolment rate of non-formal education programme by 25% by 2005 and 50% by 2007
- Increase the integration of Quranic schools by 20% by 2005 and 40% by 2007
- Raise the enrolment of school girl-child by 30% by 2005 and 55% by 2007
- Increase tertiary enrolment rate by 20% by 2005 and 35% by 2007
- Improve the quality of tertiary education (certification) in the State by 25 by 2007

Comment: Targets are cumbersome and needs to be streamlined in line with resource availability. They are time bound and measurable.

Health

- Reduce the prevalence of common diseases especially polio, malaria and TBL by 50% by 2006 and 75% by 2007
- Reduce maternal, and child mortality rates by 55% by 2005 and 90% by 2007
- Reduce the prevalence rate of HIV/AIDS by 50% by 2007
- Increase life expectancy at birth from the present to about 50 years to 55 years by 2007

Comments: Targets are realistic.

Water

- Increase access to water supply from the current 40% to 70% by 2007
- Increase sanitation level by 50% by 2007
- Increasing the water quality level to standards recommend by WHO

Comments: Targets are well streamlined, specific, measurable and achievable.

Power

- Increase rural dwellers access to electricity from the current 45 percent to 85 percent by 2007
- Increase the regularity of electricity supply from the current 50% to 75% by 2007

Comments: Targets are measurable and time bound.

Agriculture

- Increase maize production to 5 metric tones per hectare In 2004 to 5.6 metric ton per hectare in 2007
- Raise rice production by 1.5 metric ton in 2004 to 5.5 metric ton in 2007
- Increase vegetable production from 15.0 metric ton in 2004 to 40.0 metric ton
- Increase millet production from 2.5 metric ton in 2004 to 4.5 metric ton

Comments: Targets: Targets are measurable and time bound.

Environment

- To reduce the intensity of Gulley erosion and other township by 50% by year 2005
- To reduce air and water pollution by 50% by year 2007
- To increase available grazing land by 25% by year 2007
- To improve the state bio diversity by 15% by 2007

Comment: Targets are specific and time bound.



Solid Minerals

- Increasing the number of operators in this sector by 500% by 2007
- The strategies for actualizing these are:
- Enter into partnership with reputable technical partners in any of the resources available in commercial quantity
- Ensure Ministry of Commerce and Industry participates in trade fair activities within and outside the country
- Encourage wealthy citizens and their friends to set up businesses in this sector
- Provide various incentive structures such as tax holidays, provision of plots in the State industrial layouts

Comment: Target is vague and not specific.

Gender

- Increase women participation in policy and decision making at all levels by 50% by 2007
- Reduce unemployment between male and female by 60% by 2007 and 90% by 2010
- Reduce gender inequalities that are manifested in several ways in access to resources health, education, resources and unemployment, productive health by 70% by 2007
- Reduce all forms of harmful traditional practise by 80% by 2007
- Encouraging gender equality in Gombe state by creating equal opportunities in the economic sector by 2010
- Reduce vulnerability to HIV/STDS by 60% by 2010
- Reduce maternal and child mortality by 85% by 2007

Comments: Targets should focus on the MTEF and reviewed after 2007.

HIV/AIDS

- Contribute to a 50% reduction in the prevalence rate in the State by 2007
- Increase safe-sex behaviour among risk by 25% by 2007
- Reduce the incidence of sexually transmitted disease by 50% in Gombe State

Comment: Target 1 is measurable but not timebound. Target 3, 4, 5 and 8 are not timebound. Targets 1, 2 and 6 are specific, timebound and realistic.

Tourism

- Ensuring that one tourist attraction is developed in each Local Government by 2007

Comment: Target is realistic but not aggressive. They are measurable and time bound.

Overall Comments:

SEEDS document does not give current indices, thus making it difficult to determine whether stated targets are realistic.



2.2.4 Priority Areas that Address MDGs

MDGs	Gombe State
1. Eradicate Extreme Poverty And Hunger	The program to stimulate employment for the rural dweller, youths and women and encourage acquisition of skills clearly focuses on eradicating extreme poverty and hunger.
2. Achieve Universal Primary Education	Priority areas of developing early childhood and primary education meets MDG goal 2 of achieving universal primary education
3. Promote Gender Equality And Empower Women	The state has aggressive program for mainstreaming gender in the socio economic sectors in the state
4. Reduce Child Mortality	The health sector program focuses on reducing child mortality rate
5. Improve Maternal Health	The targets and strategies in the health sector were well streamlined to improve maternal health
6. Combat Hiv/Aids, Malaria And Other Diseases	The policy trust and targets to reduce HIV prevalence rate and provide support to PLWHA partly meets MDG goals. There were no clear strategies on how to combat malaria.
7. Ensure Environmental Sustainability	The States program on environment meets MDG goals
8. Develop A Global Partnership For Development	The States collaboration with Donor Agencies like UNDP and the World Bank qualifies them for meeting this MDG goal

2.2.5 Gender Mainstreaming

- The Gombe State was very aggressive in articulating policies to empower women and encourage gender equality.
- They were able to streamline gender issues in education, HIV/AIDS, health and safety nets for protecting vulnerable groups.
- The next crucial step will be to clearly articulate gender issues and strategies and mainstream them in growth related sectors like SME, Agriculture, Tourism and Mineral Exploration

2.3 Budget and Financing

2.3.1 Revenue and Revenue Sources

Revenue sources (FAAC, IGR, VAT etc.) were identified and discussed. The projections into 2007 were not available in the report. Table 5.5 that was expected to highlight the historical data on IGR, Federal Statutory Allocation (FSA) and Value Added Tax (VAT) was missing from the document.

The prose however commented on the performance of the various revenue sources as follows:

- The IGR component in the state budget between 1997 and 2002 averaged 6.8% of the total revenue during the period.
- State funding of projects is heavily dependent on the Federal Statutory Allocation, which represents 80.79% of the total revenue during the period 1997-2002.

VAT accounted for 12.41% during the period.



The projected figures for revenue into 2007 may have to be made available to assess how realistic they are to implement the state strategies. The low level of the IGR (6.8%), which is the only main revenue source under the control of the state reveals that the state has been financially unstable. There is a need to articulate ways of improving the level of IGR of the state.

2.3.2 Spending Distribution Costed by Capital and Recurrent Expenditure

There is no information on expenditure in the document

2.3.3 Spending Priorities and Gain

There is no information on expenditure in the document

2.3.4 Funding Plan among Stakeholders

A cost sharing strategy (e.g. LGAs, PPP, NGOs, Donors) has not been distinctly articulated in the State strategy document.

2.3.5 Funding Gaps and Solutions

Funding gap determination is impossible as necessary information to make it possible is not available.

2.4 Implementation

2.4.1 Institutional Arrangements for Implementation

No clearly understood institutional framework for implementation was proposed. However a few complementary implementation strategies were proposed as stated below.

To further support its implementation strategy, a good communication strategy was developed and proposed. Thus government plans to employ radio and television to:

- Serialize the SEEDS document
- Produce jingles to encourage the reading of the document
- Organise discussion programmes
- Organise drama presentations on aspect of SEEDS
- Make regular press releases to inform the people on the progress being made and difficulties encountered in implementing SEEDS.

Copies of the document will be distributed to schools, public libraries, palaces, mosque and churches, and the civil society organisations. The document shall be translated into local languages including Arabic to enable wider patronage of the document.

Adopt methods using traditional institutions, religions bodies, town criers, village square meetings, inter-face sessions, folklores and songs to reach the people.

In addition to the foregoing, the document shall be posted on Internet for easy access.

In conclusion, more work needs to be done in clearly prescribing an institutional framework for implementation of Gombe State SEEDS with graphical illustration to show linkages and reporting lines. It is a rallying point for other implementation strategy.



2.4.2 Roles of Stakeholders

These have not been proposed.

2.4.3 Specific Risks and Mitigation

Specific risks and mitigating factors have not been identified

2.4.4 Action Plan

Defined action plan has not been supplied.

2.5 Monitoring and Evaluation

2.5.1 Mechanisms for Monitoring and Evaluation

No information on monitoring and evaluation was made available anywhere in the report.

2.5.2 Verifiable and Measurable Indicators

Verifiable and measurable indicators were not proposed.

2.6 Pilot Projects

No pilot projects were proposed.

3.0 RECOMMENDATIONS AND NEXT STEPS

3.1 Recommendations

The shortcomings observed in the Gombe SEEDS document should be addressed before the zero draft is finalized.

3.2 Next Steps

Consultants should be deployed to the state to provide guidance in addressing all aspects of the review comments. Their Terms of Reference should include a thorough desk review of the document to agree his findings with the findings of this review. This has become necessary because many states have since improved upon the status of their SEEDS beyond the present zero draft level.



Slgp

ANNEX 5

YOBE STATE SEEDS REVIEW



Table of Contents

1.0	INTRODUCTION.....	70
1.1	Background	70
1.2	Objective of the Review.....	71
1.3	Approach	71
1.4	Limitations	71
2.0	REVIEW OF YOBE STATE SEEDS	71
2.1	Profile of Yobe State	71
2.2	Policy	72
2.2.1	Priority Linkages and Disparities between NEEDS and SEEDS	72
2.2.2	Situational Analysis, Policy Thrusts, Targets and Strategies	72
2.2.3	Whether Timelines for Targets are Realistic	74
2.2.4	Priority Areas that Address MDGs.....	76
2.2.5	Gender Mainstreaming	77
2.3	Budget and Financing	77
2.3.1	Revenue and Revenue Sources.....	77
2.3.2	Spending Distribution Costed by Capital and Recurrent Expenditure ...	77
2.3.3	Spending Priorities and Gain.....	78
2.3.4	Funding Plan among Stakeholders	78
2.3.5	Funding Gaps and Solutions	78
2.4	Implementation.....	78
2.4.1	Institutional Arrangements for Implementation	78
2.4.2	Roles of Stakeholders	78
2.4.3	Specific Risks and Mitigation.....	78
2.4.4	Action Plan	78
2.5	Monitoring and Evaluation.....	78
2.5.1	Mechanisms for Monitoring and Evaluation.....	78
2.5.2	Verifiable and Measurable Indicators	78
2.6	Pilot Projects	79
3.0	RECOMMENDATIONS AND NEXT STEPS.....	79
3.1	Recommendations	79
3.2	Next Steps.....	79



1.0 INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background

The National Planning Commission (NPC) has taken responsibility for developing a State Economic Empowerment and Development Strategy (SEEDS) programme. In the context of NEEDS, and the fact that over fifty-two percent of the federal allocation is distributed to States and Local Governments, it was felt important that there should not just be strategies developed for federal governance improvement, but also for states.

The role of the NPC in developing SEEDS is clearly different from the role of federal ministries in the development of NEEDS. NEEDS is a strategy developed by the Federal Government with a measure of popular involvement. Likewise SEEDS must be developed by State Governments. It is not for NPC to develop it for them. NPC's role is as a facilitator in this process.

In the last one and a half years since the development of SEEDS, all 36 states and the Federal Capital Territory (FCT) have developed their SEEDS document, which are at various stages of preparation. The FCT version of SEEDS is called FEEDS. Despite this there is very little knowledge of what the SEEDS documents are proposing, whether they are achievable and what they mean for Federal Government's ability to develop a coordinated development agenda through the NEEDS/SEEDS program.

The NPC has also embarked on a benchmarking exercise from 6th June. 29 of the 36 states volunteered themselves to be part of this exercise. The process was organized around four benchmarks, which are meant to test the quality of each state's SEEDS. It is anticipated that the exercise will result in a scoring and ranking of the states. FG and donors plan to use the results of this exercise to identify states that can receive additional project support as best performers and states that will receive technical support to advance to a level where they can qualify for project support.

It is also expected that this exercise will also put the states in a position to focus on areas of improvement, which may mean further revision of their SEEDS. In anticipation of this the NPC has drafted a revised version of the SEEDS manual to provide more detailed guidance on how to make each state's SEEDS more effective. Also, NPC thinks it is important to begin to review all the state SEEDS so as to develop a knowledge base that can help in their dialogue with the states and national development objectives. This will also help NPC in any plans to revise NEEDS, which it hopes can leverage off state SEEDS and provide a more uniform and efficient national development agenda.

It is against this background that the Economic Adviser and Chief Executive of the NPC has approved for a team of NPC staff supported by national consultants to review all the SEEDS documents and build a knowledge base of what the SEEDS documents are proposing and how they affect the country's development objectives.



1.2 Objective of the Review

The objective of the review is to build a knowledge base of what Yobe State SEEDS document is proposing and how it affects the country's development objectives.

1.3 Approach

The approach employed was a desk review of Yobe State SEEDS document and building a knowledge base on its proposals using some specified key variables. These variables ultimately formed the basis of comparing all the states in the Northeast zone.

1.4 Limitations

Some of the prints were blurred constituting visual impediment. There is reason to believe that a second volume of the document existed elsewhere, which was not available at the time of review. Time for the review of the five documents was considered too short.

2.0 REVIEW OF YOBE STATE SEEDS

2.1 Profile of Yobe State

Yobe State was created on 27th August 1991. It has 21 LGAs. It shares common political boundaries with Jigawa and Bauchi States to the west, Borno and Bauchi States to the east and north and Gombe state to the north, respectively. It also shares an international political border of 323km along with the Republic of Niger to the North.

River Yobe is a prominent geographical feature of the State, which flows through Jakusko, Bade, Bunari, Yunusari and Geidam local government areas before emptying in to Lake Chad, is a source of livelihood to a large number of settlements. Other popular rivers include Anurnma, Katarko, Hadejia, Kumadugu Gana, etc.

Over 80% of the States population is rural and is heavily dependent on agriculture. The State is one of the largest suppliers of livestock in Nigeria. It is noted as the 'Meat Store' of sub-Saharan African. It has the largest cattle markets in West Africa. The State produces both food and cash crops such as millet, sorghum and rice. These are grown in abundance for subsistence livelihood while groundnut, cotton, beans, cowpea, benni seeds and tree crops like gum Arabic, shea butter are grown/raised for sale. The State is quite popular for its inter-State trades in fishing, vegetables, grains and livestock.

The State is the home of abundant deposits of several types of minerals like potash, gypsum, limestone, kaolin, trona, silica, sand, diatomite, quartz, and soda ash. Spring water is found in every location in the state. Large deposits of gypsum are available in Fune, fika, Gujba and Gulan local government areas. Diatomite, kaolin, quartz are found in abundant in Gujba and Gulan local government areas.

Cottages industries exist in various locations in the local governments.

Data available on literacy and illiteracy rates for ages 6-11 years for primary school level, 12-17 years for secondary level and 18-24 years for tertiary level by sex had shown that Yobe State had the lowest literacy rate with only 37.6% male and 27.5% female being literate in 1991.

Another problem of the State is the lack of access to safe water supply.



The state outline is adequate but more up to date statistics (2004) will be required for the vital variables needed for planning of a good state SEEDS.

2.2 Policy

2.2.1 Priority Linkages and Disparities between NEEDS and SEEDS

NEEDS	Yobe SEEDS
<p><u>Empowering People</u>: Health, education, environment, integrated rural development, housing development, employment and youth development, safety nets, gender and geopolitical balance, and pension reforms</p>	<p>Agriculture, Health, Education, Housing, environment, Safety Nets, Gender issues, and natural resource</p>
<p><u>Promoting private enterprise</u>: Security and rule of law, infrastructure, finance, sectoral strategies, privatization and liberalization, trade, regional integration, and globalization</p>	<p>SME, Privatization of SOEs, security, investment friendly climate</p>
<p><u>Changing the way the government does its work</u>: Public sector reforms, privatization and liberalization, governance, transparency and anticorruption, service delivery, budget, and expenditure reforms</p>	<p>Public Sector Reforms, Service Delivery, Governance, Transparency and Anti-Corruption, Budget and Expenditure Reforms</p>

Yobe State SEEDS covered certain priority areas of NEEDS in empowering people, promotion of private enterprises and changing the way government does its works. There are strong priority linkages between the State Policy Targets as contained in the SEEDS document and NEEDS.

A critical review of the policy thrusts and targets requires streamlining to match expectations with resource potentials and capabilities of the state.

2.2.2 Situational Analysis, Policy Thrusts, Targets and Strategies

Agriculture

- Agriculture is the mainstay of the economy
- Arable land with opportunities for animal husbandry, horticulture, fishing
- There is problem of inadequate inputs, fragmented land tenure system, absence of price support, poor storage facilities, poor infrastructure and poor credit support.

SME

- Clear cut strategies for SME growth
- Clear ideas on how to convert farm produce through agro allied industries



Education

- 1867 Primary Schools, 65 Secondary Schools, four Science and Technology School, seven vocational schools
- Transition from Primary School to Secondary School is 10,000

Health

- Buildings and physical infrastructure are in bad shape
- Outdated equipment, fake drugs, and poorly motivated staff
- 80% of primary health care facilities malfunctioning
- Six killer diseases are prevalent: Guinea worm, Onchosiariosis, Tuberculosis and Cerebro Spinal Meningitis
- Maternal Mortality rate: 800/1000 live births in 1997
- 11 General Hospital, one Federal Medical Centre, 270 Primary Care Centre, 14 Private Clinics, 18 Comprehensive Health Centres, School of Nursing, 40 Medical Doctors, 13 Pharmacists, 370 Nurses, 44 Community Health Workers, 44 Qualified Medical Lab Technologist. Total of 3256 Medical personnel in 2003

Water

- Streams, Rivers, Ponds and lakes
- Lack Of access to safe water supply by the teeming population
- 7.6% have access to tap water in the house
- 19.8% have access to tap water outside the house
- 300 cement wells, 100 new boreholes, 50 dormant generating sets procured

Power

- Erratic Power Supply
- 21 Towns are linked to NEPA grid
- 33 KVA capacity in place to Geidam from Potiskum

HIV/AIDS

- Prevalence rate is 1.9%

Solid Minerals

- Rich in Mineral deposits like Potash, Gypsum, Limestone, Kaolin, Silica, diatomite, quartz, Soda Ash
- Large deposits of gypsum in Fune, Fika, Gujba and Gulani

Transportation

- Network of roads is not advanced
- Road construction and culverts under construction
- Rural roads under construction

Public Sector Reforms

- Programs on due process in procurement and contracts

Agriculture: The Agriculture Policy thrust of the state is designed to take advantage of the vast opportunities existing in the Agricultural sector with a large landmass to jump-start the economy of the state. The growth strategies of the State will revolve around agriculture



SME: The target is meant to address the poor industry profile of the state. While they need to be streamlined and robust, there is strong correlation between the policy thrusts, targets, strategies and the state of SME in the state.

Education: The focus on access to universal basic education and improving standards connotes strong relationship between policy trusts, targets and strategies. The emphasis on schools that offers vocational training has strong linkage in their SME growth strategies.

Health: The health policy thrust is geared towards ensuring a well-managed health system with emphasis on addressing MDG priorities. The underlying challenge will be manifested in matching resources with priorities.

Water: The policy targets and strategies are meant to increase access to clean water in the state.

Power: While the state has serious problems in the power sector, there is no mention of clear strategies and targets on how to address it.

HIV/AIDS: The prevalence rate of 1.9% is among the lowest in the federation. Notwithstanding the state has aggressive programs manifested in the targets and strategies to arrest outbreaks of the disease in the state.

Solid Minerals: The state is blessed with mineral endowment but there is no program on how to harness it.

Public Sector Reform and Good Governance: There is a link between the policy thrust to right size the civil service, fight corruption and ensure due process in procurement and contracts.

2.2.3 Whether Timelines for Targets are Realistic

SME

- Raising socio economic development of the state to 15% by 2007 or 45% in 2004
- Encourage women in development to 14% in 2007 from 5% in 2004
- Raising standard of living and eradicating poverty by 30% in 2007 from 78% in 2003
- Creating employment opportunities by 15% in 2007 over 47% in 2004
- Develop capacity not only to expand raw material but to learn skills of management by 10% in 2007 from 2% in 2004
- Build industrial layout throughout the state in order to attract private investors. This will raise the level of achievement by 7% in 2007

Comment: The targets are measurable and time bound. However, there is need to spell out basis for measurement from baseline studies

Education

- Yobe State Government has planned to expand institutional capacity to produce 12,000 qualified work force by the year 2007
- Government plans to increase school enrolment by 78% by the year 2007
- Stimulate low income group and empower them to reduce poverty at least 25% by the year 2007



- Technical schools will be expanded to address private sector requirements by 35%
- Vocational education will receive a boost so that the private sector problem of unemployment will be eliminated by 2007
- Reduction in the number of primary aged girls out of schools by 25% (i.e. from 140,000 to 37,500) by 2007
- More non-formal schools will be encouraged to be established with a View to reducing cases of out of schools students by 40% in 2007

Comment: Targets are time bound and measurable. Costing will be crucial in determining whether the state can match targets with resources.

Health

- Improve awareness and access of Youth to information, treatment and Counseling on sexually transmitted diseases and reproductive health to reach 60% by 2007
- Reduce child Mortality in all the 40 local government areas by 20% by the year 2007
- Reduce maternal mortality rate by 20% in 2007
- Recruit, train and motivate workforce to provide quality health care by 2007; additional 40% to be recruited, 60% to undergo training and 100% to be motivated
- Improve Primary Health Care by 70% by 2007
- Supply 60% of the drugs needed by community in 2007
- Reduce prevalence of malaria, Onchociasis, guinea worm to the barest minimum by 2007

Comments: Targets are measurable and time bound. However, ability to match targets with resource base will be vital in ensuring success.

Water

- 78 improved surface run-off collection ponds and 22 developed water storage depressions combined would store about 4,658,040m³ of water per year. Based on the average water requirement, up to 35% of water needs of both human and livestock who are likely to be available for use;
- The three small earth dams and eight irrigation schemes will bring about 2,400ha of land under irrigation with an expected 19,000 tonnes per year of assorted vegetables;
- 20 river back flow control gates is expected to sustain the flooding area for various uses ranging from agric activities, livestock watering, fishing, recreation, habitat for migration birds and unique biodiversity;
- Rehabilitated and improved flood control dykes, three of which will effectively protect the three largest towns in the Northern parts of Yobe State;

Comments: Targets are well streamlined, specific, measurable and achievable.

Agriculture

An average growth rate of 10% per annum has been set for the sector, in order to:

- Increase production for export crops with a view of opening up export, expanding and diversification of the state economy
- Expand employment opportunities to absorb increasing labour force of the state
- Encourage the production of agric commodities on commercial basis in areas of foods crops, tree crops, livestock, fisheries and forestry.
- Improve standard of living of rural communities.



- Increase income generation of smallholder farmers.
- Improve processing and storage facilities including development of buffer stock against crop failure.
- Development of agric marketing structure

Comments: Targets: Targets are not measurable and time bound.

Gender

Address gender inequality through UBE by reducing the number of primary aged girls out of school in all the LGs

- 20% improvement in net enrolment and learning achievement for the girl child by 2007
- Establish at least right based girl child model schools by 2007
- Improve level faculty by 20% each year to 2007
- Contribute to reducing gender gap in enrolment by at least 50% of the 10,000 figure in ten LGs with lowest enrolment for girls by 2007

Comment: Some targets are not quantifiable and measurable.

HIV/AIDS

- Reduce the impact of HIV/AIDS on new born and young children in all the 40 local governments by 50% by the year 2007
- Prevent mother to child transmission by 50% in the 40 local government by the year 2007
- Provide care and supports to 4% of those infected with HIV/AIDS (including orphans) in all the 40 local government areas by the year 2007
- Promote awareness on the dangers of HIV/AIDS and the need to develop positive change among the state communities to cover 80% by the year 2007

Comment: Target is measurable and time bound.

Overall Comments: SEEDS document does not give current indices, thus making it difficult to determine whether stated targets are realistic.

2.2.4 Priority Areas that Address MDGs

MDGs	Yobe State
1. Eradicate extreme poverty and hunger	The program to encourage acquisition of skills by youths and women clearly focuses on eradicating extreme poverty and hunger.
2. Achieve Universal Primary Education	Priority areas of developing primary education meets MDG goal 2 of achieving universal primary education
1QA\	Focus on education of the girl child and encouraging enrollment to promote gender
4. Reduce Child Mortality	The health priority focuses on reducing child mortality rate
5.Improve Maternal Health	Priority areas of Health addresses MDG goals 5 for improving maternal health
6.Combat HIV/AIDS, Malaria and Other Diseases	The policy trust and targets to reduce HIV prevalence rate of 1.9% and provide support to PLWHA partly meets MDG goals. There was mention of combating malaria but no clear strategies o how to achieve it.
7. Ensure environmental Sustainability	There was no program on protection and sustainability of the environment
8. Develop a global partnership for development	The States collaborates with international Donor Agencies and development partners on related programs in the state



2.2.5 Gender Mainstreaming

- The state designed programs for increasing enrollment and education of the girl child
- The establishment of skills acquisition centre in the local government that will focus on women was mentioned but no clear strategies on how to carry out the program and mainstream it in the growth areas.
- There are no attempts to mainstream gender in key growth areas like SME and agriculture
- Gender participation in driving the health program was hardly mentioned

2.3 Budget and Financing

2.3.1 Revenue and Revenue Sources

Revenue sources (FAAC, IGR, VAT etc.) were identified but neither their historical data nor projections into 2007 were available in the report. However, revenue projection was made for only 2005 forming the basis for expenditure estimates to finance the 2005 strategies. The basis for the projection was not provided

Emerging Queries and Issues

- A disaggregating of the state IGR into component revenue sources has not been done.
- The projected figures for revenue into 2007 have to be made available to assess how realistic they are to implement the state strategies.
- Basis for revenue projection (i.e. growth rates for each source of revenue curled from past performances) were however not available. Hence, it becomes difficult to say whether the revenue projection is realistic or not.

In conclusion, the revenue projections are not likely to be realistic.

2.3.2 Spending Distribution Costed by Capital and Recurrent Expenditure

Table 2 summarizes the revenue projection against sectoral investment cost for 2005 taken from the prose. The table reveals that there is no funding gap.

Table 2: Summary of Revenue and Expenditure, 2005 in Billions					
Year	Total Revenue	Expenditure			Funding Gap
		Capital	Recurrent	Total	
2005	33.12	19.17	13.95	33.12	Nil
Total	33.12	19.17	13.95	33.12	Nil

Costing and projection of priority areas were done. A balanced budget was achieved. Expenditure priorities were directed towards enhancing basic infrastructures that would provide the needed stimulus for encouraging economic growth. There was also a heavy focus on social services and poverty alleviation projects. Spending distribution was presented by capital and recurrent although the State budget summary was not shown. This however does not imply that recurrent costs of investments were costed.



There were no indications that costs were assigned to the policy targets and also no conscious efforts have been made to identify those recurrent costs that are developmental in nature.

2.3.3 Spending Priorities and Gain

Sectoral spending priorities for 2005 include:

- Economic sector - 34.26%
- Social sector - 31.97%
- Regional Development - 20.10%
- General Administration - 13.67%

A further analysis revealed that top sub-sectoral priorities under sectoral spending include:

- Economic sector – agriculture
- Social sector – education
- Regional Development – water resources

Priority gains were not mentioned.

2.3.4 Funding Plan among Stakeholders

A cost sharing strategy (e.g. LGAs, PPP, NGOs, Donors) has not been distinctly articulated in the State strategy document.

2.3.5 Funding Gaps and Solutions

There is no funding gap.

2.4 Implementation

2.4.1 Institutional Arrangements for Implementation

None was proposed.

2.4.2 Roles of Stakeholders

Not Applicable

2.4.3 Specific Risks and Mitigation

Specific risks and mitigating factors have not been identified

2.4.4 Action Plan

Defined action plan has not been supplied.

2.5 Monitoring and Evaluation

2.5.1 Mechanisms for Monitoring and Evaluation

None was proposed.

2.5.2 Verifiable and Measurable Indicators

Verifiable/measurable indicators and anticipated risks and proposed ways of mitigating them were not proposed.



2.6 Pilot Projects

Pilot projects proposed are as follows:

Girl Child

This was a pilot project for girl child education programme initiated in 1992 but was abandoned. The project was realized as one of the significant ways of propagating female education in Yobe state. The project was designed to involve street children, hawkers and traders who were not in schools or dropped out of schools.

HIV/AIDS

Smoked Fish Project

Smoked fish remain a palatable source of food. One of the major reasons for smoking fish is to curtail infestation of fishes from microbial activities, wastages and spoilages.

Oil Seed Processing

Making Pasteurize Milk and Yogurt: (1000 Litres/hour)

Production of poultry table birds

Dehydrated fruits and vegetable production (132 tonnes per annum)

Fish Farming

Production of Industrial Adhesives 1500 litres per annum)

Blacksmithing

Pottery

These are considered too many and should be prioritized and reduced. Their anticipated impacts on the citizenry should be mentioned.

3.0 RECOMMENDATIONS AND NEXT STEPS

3.1 Recommendations

The shortcomings observed in the Yobe SEEDS document should be addressed before the zero draft is finalized.

3.2 Next Steps

Consultants should be deployed to the state to provide guidance in addressing all aspects of the review comments. Their Terms of Reference should include a thorough desk review of the document to agree his findings with the findings of this review. This has become necessary because many states have since improved upon the status of their SEEDS beyond the present zero draft level.